

Review

for Demina Ivancheva's PhD dissertation

Origin and Development of Words Expressing the Emotion of Anger in Ibero-Romance Languages

by Assoc. Prof. Dr. Albena Mircheva-Zhechkova

The PhD work of Demina Ivancheva *Origin and Development of Words Expressing the Emotion of Anger in Ibero-Romance Languages* is a volume of 202 standard pages and includes a total of five parts with an introduction and conclusion, followed by a bibliography, glossaries, biographical data, and abbreviations.

The dissertation introduction (1-5 p.) clarifies the aims, subject matter and methodology of the study. The main tasks are clearly formulated, namely: based on the review of scientific theories of emotions and anger in particular, to present the etymologies and patterns of semantic development of anger words in Ibero-Romance languages and to draw relevant conclusions and generalizations. The detailed linguistic analysis focuses on Portuguese and Spanish, but also includes linguistic material from nearby Ibero-Romance languages such as Catalan and Galician, and makes a comparison to many other Indo-European languages, especially Latin as a proto-language of the Romance language group.

Texts from all genres of fiction as well as scientific, historical, theological and political texts are studied and analyzed. The study of such a huge volume of linguistic material from all historical eras: the earliest written sources (biblical literature and the first written monuments of the Romance languages), ancient, medieval and renaissance literature to modern texts can be counted as an exceptional merit of the dissertation, which ensures the reliability and persuasiveness of the final conclusions. Here we should add the impressive number of lexicographical tools used, among which are the first dictionaries of the Ibero-Romance languages of the 16th and 17th centuries by A. Barbosa, G. Cardoso, K. Casas, K. Orozco, B. Pereyra, A. Nebrija.

The methodological approach is defined as interdisciplinary, with applied methods from different sciences: linguistics, psychology, philosophy, sociology and cultural anthropology. This type of

methodology is adequate to the set goal of an in-depth philological analysis of the considered words for anger, not only in terms of etymology and semantics, but also in relation to general human values and perceptions, as well as to the cultural-historical and social context of the respective era.

The next part of the dissertation (pp. 5-15) deals with etymology as a science, since it is the etymological reconstruction and the establishment of the original etymon that is the starting point and the main focus of the study of anger words in the present work. The derivation of the proto-form and the possible Indo-European root at the phonetic, morphological and word-formation level are linked to the semantic reconstruction and, consequently, to the historical lexicology through which the diachronic semantic development of the studied lexicon is traced. Here the author presents the scientific criteria and methods for etymologizing words and addresses the problems of semantic development related to four main factors of changes in lexical meaning: the semasiological and onomasiological mechanism, analogical and non-analogical changes. Special attention is paid to the so-called non-analogous changes - narrowing and expanding the meaning and polysemy, which are the most common cause of semantic changes. Two models of semantic change in the field of polysemy are synthesized in example tables, focusing on the typology of linguistic metaphors and metonymies.

In the general theoretical basis of the study, the basic concepts of emotion are also presented (third part of the dissertation - pp. 15-31). The question of the categorization of different types of emotions is a complex and controversial one, dating back to Ancient Greece, and there is still no clear answer. Part three, sub-headings: 'emotion and sociology', 'behavioral theories of emotion', 'emotions and psychology', 'emotions and linguistics' examines the connection of emotions to a range of physiological, behavioral, social, cultural and religious factors. The main classification models and theories of emotions are commented: Darwin, James-Lange and Cannon-Bard, as well as phenomenological theories. The distinction between the concepts of feeling and emotion is discussed, noting the important role of the social environment in the formation of emotions and examining Wierzbicka's theory of the semantic equivalents of basic human concepts and their realization in languages. D. Ivancheva clarifies that in the present work the term "emotion" refers "to both physiological and cognitive processes" (p. 20).

The fourth part of the dissertation "Anger - Definition and Development in Indo-European Languages" represents the actual research work. The author defines anger as one of the basic emotions and examines it through the prism of ancient philosophy (Aristotle, Seneca), modern psychology (Kemp, Izard, Strongman), modern cognitive theories (A. Wierzbicka) and feminist concepts. In two tables, all the words in the Indo-European languages expressing anger (table 1) and rage, rage (table 2) are systematized. Correspondences in dead languages such as Gothic, Sanskrit, Old Greek, Latin, Old High German, Old Norse, etc. are also handed down. - this rich linguistic material provides a clear starting point for the subsequent etymologizing and semantic reconstruction of the specific vocabulary in the Ibero-Romance languages. After the introduction to the psychological and linguistic problematics of the emotion anger, a thorough philological analysis of the studied words in Portuguese and Spanish follows: port./ span. *cólera*; port. *fúria*/ span. *furia*; port./ span. *furor*; port./ span. *ira*; port. *raiva*/ span. *rabies*; port. *sanha*/ esp. *saña* and span. *enfadar*. The seven words are analyzed in an identical pattern: the etymology of the corresponding lexeme is first deduced and then its lexical and semantic "life" in both languages is traced by examining the entire lexical paradigm of related words: nouns, adjectives, adverbs and verbs, as well as phraseologisms - by citing and analyzing multiple authentic sources in diachronic form from their earliest attestation. Port./ sp. *cólera* is the only word with a certain etymology that does not come from Latin, but from Old Greek. *χολέρα* 'cholera, nausea, vomiting' (from *χολή* 'bile, anger, disgust'). In terms of its etymon, the word *cólera* is associated with both infectious disease and bile as an anger-producing organ, hence the diachronic semantic development of *cólera* in both languages is clearly delineated: bile fluid > anger. In both Portuguese and Spanish the word is analyzed in the context of the ancient theory (as early as St. Isadore of Seville in the 6th-7th centuries) of the four humors in the human body: *cólera*, *sangre*, *melanconia*, *flema* (p. 45).

In detail and precisely, with numerous cited sources from ancient to modern authors, the nuances in the semantic development of the two etymologically related words port are commented. *fúria* / span. *furia* and port./ span. *furor*: "...anger (*furor*), however violent, may remain hidden in the depths of the soul, it may be part of our being, but it is *furor* that will manifest itself outwardly, it is the thing that will separate itself from us. According to Pombo (2011: 407), the main difference between the two words is that *furia* is the effect or manifestation of *furor*" (p. 67).

Prophetic madness (*furor propheticus*), poetic madness (*furor poético*) and fanatical madness (*furor santo*) are also variously associated with the word *furor*.

Ira, the basic word for anger in Latin, passed into Portuguese and Spanish, has a secure etymology from the Proto-Italic. **eizā* < ie. **h₁ey-* 'move quickly, push' and the corresponding semantic development in the languages: quick movement > anger, rage. The word *ira* refers to the wrath of God, as well as one of the seven deadly sins. All cognates of Lat. *ira* with their correspondences in Portuguese are well attested and described in the earliest dictionaries of Lusitanian and Portuguese (in the table on pp. 91-92). It is a curious fact that in Spanish the two verbs *airar* and *irar* (usually synonymous) are found in the early 12th century poem *Poema de Mio Cid* ("Poem of my Cid"), where they have shades of meaning: "*Airar* carries the sense of 'falling out of favor with my master,' while *irar* is associated with the emotional state - 'becoming angry' (p. 97).

The words port. *raiva* / span. *rabia* derive from Lat. *rabiō*, *-ere* 'go mad' (from a probable IE root **rabh-* 'move violently') and as semantics are associated with the extreme manifestations of anger following the semantic development madness > anger. In both Romance languages *raiva* and *rabia* are used for both humans and animals, and are associated with the disease rabies in dogs; in Spanish *rabia* has multiple contextual uses in the prepositional construction *con rabia*, and in various word combinations: *a rabiar*; *estar tocado de la rabia*; *rabiar de verse juntos*.

The author presents in detail the different points of view surrounding the controversial etymology of port. *sanha* and span. *saña*, related to Lat. *insania* and brings out three possibilities of diachronic semantics: madness > anger; mockery, ridicule > anger, sickness, disease > malaise > anger (p. 124). The general impression of the complex analysis of a port. *sanha* and isp. *saña* and their cognate verbs is that in both languages the idea of anger as madness and insanity is strongly represented.

Lastly, the Spanish verb *enfadar* 'to make angry, annoy' is considered, which has developed this meaning late from the original 'to tire, bore' associated with the Sp. *fado* (from Latin *fatum*) 'fate, destiny'. In this case, we are talking about an unconventional semantic transition - I get bored, I get tired > I get angry > I get angry, which appeared only in the European norm of the Spanish

language in literature after the Middle Ages, while in Portuguese the verb enfadar has preserved its original semantics.

In the conclusion of the dissertation, the results of tracing the etymology and diachronic semantics of the considered words in the Ibero-Romance languages are synthesized and summarized. Despite the common origin of Spanish and Portuguese words (mainly from Latin), the study takes into account the changes that have occurred in their semantic development in both languages (intensity of anger), as well as the differences in the linguistic expression of anger as an emotion. One of the important findings is that "semantically, anger words are associated with disease or imbalance in the body, with madness on the one hand, and with the notion of rapid movement on the other." (p. 151). The main semantic transitions with their corresponding vocabulary in Portuguese and Spanish, as well as parallels in other Indo-European languages are visually presented in a table. The idea of giving the analyzed words in Spanish and Portuguese in chronological order relative to the sources in which they are attested the earliest is very meaningful.

In the final part of the dissertation, D. Ivancheva made a chronological review of important events related to the socio-political and economic development, history and literature of Spain and Portugal, which has a useful informative value regarding the use of words in a historical and cultural context. In my opinion, such a historical exposition should rather be present in the introductory part of the dissertation and prepare the reader for a better understanding of the nuances in the semantics of the words in the presented literary and scientific texts of the relevant historical era. An important finding that has its place in the conclusion is that "Some of the words meaning anger are attested precisely in the period of the 13th-14th centuries and the 16th century. One of the reasons why their frequent use is observed at this time is largely due to the Reconquista" (p. 161).

The bibliography of the dissertation covers an impressive volume of scholarly literature, specialized etymological dictionaries and literary works in various languages; also included are "biographical data" of the Portuguese, Spanish, ancient and other authors cited, from which valuable information is extracted for the reader in the footnotes of the PhD work.

The Abstract of the dissertation corresponds to its content, synthesizes the most relevant information from the study and summarizes the results. The main contributions of the dissertation are presented here, among which the following achievements stand out: for the first time, a detailed lexical and etymological analysis of words meaning 'anger' in comparative Spanish and Portuguese is made and the semantic transitions attested in the two Iberomance languages are identified; the history of words from the earliest attested sources is traced; the use of the words in texts from different periods and genres, referring to important cultural and historical events in Portugal and Spain, is analyzed (p.39). Three articles on the topic of the dissertation, which were published in 2022 and 2023, should also be considered as scientific contributions.

What distinguishes this dissertation is the competent language and mastered scientific terminology, as well as good structure and layout. The PhD student shows a high level of competence in Portuguese and Spanish and very good analytical skills for working with scientific material, thanks to which the research successfully achieves the set goals and objectives.

Some minor technical errors have been made, e.g. repeated passages on p. 33 and p. 80, and on p. 47 there is an untranslated text from the French. Furthermore, the definition of the Greek word *μῆνις* as both Greek and Doric in the sentence is not clear: "In words like Gr. *μῆνις* and Dor. *μῆνις* 'anger' the meaning 'madness, fury' occurs (p. 39).

In conclusion, Demina Ivancheva's dissertation is a thorough and precise scientific work that has an indisputable contribution to the study of the diachronic semantics of anger lexis in Ibero-Romance languages and will serve for future studies in the field of emotions in general in Indo-European languages. This fact, as well as all the other merits of the dissertation highlighted above, give me the reason with full conviction to propose to the scientific jury to award the educational and scientific degree "doctor" to Demina Ivancheva.

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Albena Mircheva-Zhechkova

Sofia, April 15, 2024.

