## SOFIA UNIVERSITY ST. KLIMENT OHRIDSKI

#### REVIEW

From Professor Dr. Polit. Sc. Todor Alexandrov Tanev, Faculty of Philosophy, Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski"

on the works of Associate professor Dr.Polit.Sc. Tatiana Trifonova Tomova

single participant in the competition for the academic position of professor in professional field 3.3 Political Science (Public and Social Policies), announced in SG, no. 54 of 29.06.2021 for the needs of SU-Faculty of Philosophy-Department of Public Administration

October 2021

# I. General characteristics of the candidate.

Associate Professor Dr.P.Sc. Tatiana Tomova made a name in Bulgarian political science. She is widely known as the founder of the Bulgarian school of public policy. Dr. Tomova participates in the establishment and transformation of this area into one of the leading theme in our country. Tomova has been systematically developing its theoretical foundation for two decades. She created a Bulgarian standard for scientific research in this field, including she is the Bulgarian researcher who fixed that part of the scientific tools in the field, which corresponds to the Bulgarian scientific thinking and which fermented with ideas his forerunner. Tomova has long researched her sector of public administration with such a degree of consistent activity that she has practically managed to pin this modern scientific theme to the national school in the field of management and politics, which has been emerging since the 1990s.

To this must be added the main role it plays in the development of social policy research - from its philosophical and economic basis to management practice. I have witnessed the gradual diligent development of today's scientist-researcher and lecturer Tatiana Tomova. She started from social policy, behind which she saw the vast field of public policy, and hence the links with a number of contemporary theories at the middle level.

It is known that Tatiana Tomova introduced these same issues in the curricula at Sofia University and other academies, where she developed the first serious courses of lectures on it. It is no coincidence that she is a sought-after and valuable academic lecturer and expert consultant on public and social policies.

Dr. Tomova is not a narrow specialist in public policy and social policy. On the contrary, she has developed the whole broad field with the connections of policies with network theory, political economy, etc. Associate Professor Tatiana Tomova acquired the title of Doctor of Science in the same vast space, although in another point - social policy, in contrast to the current competition, which is based on public policy.

Dr. Tomova is tenured member of the scientific community of Sofia University "St. Kl. Ohridski, but she also taught for years at NBU, the Bulgarian School of Politics and others. She was for 2 terms Head of the Department of PA and also Vice-dean of the Faculty of Philosophy. There is a significant amount of participation in scientific forums at home and abroad, where there are a number of specializations.

Assoc. Prof. Tatiana Tomova is a long-term participant in the academic leadership. She is currently Deputy Dean of the Faculty of Philosophy and has been 2 full-time tenures as Head of Department. The reference for the fulfillment of the minimum national requirements under art. 26 of the Law on School Education in the 3 field of science - Social, economic and legal sciences - with professional direction 3.3. Political science, which coincides entirely with the field of the competition, is performed by Dr. Tomova.

I assume that the scientific community shares my opinion that there are deep reasons for Dr. Tomova to take the academic position of professor in the professional field 3.3 Political Science.

### II. General characteristics of the works of the candidate for the competition.

Associate Professor DrPolSc Tatiana Tomova presents in this competition for a professor with 1 new monographic habilitation thesis - "The policy process: management based on narrowing" (UPress "St. Kl. Ohridski", 208 pages), 1 monograph with the characteristics of a textbook for senior executives - "Policy making, programs, projects", published by the Bulgarian School of Politics, 1 study, published in an edited collection of Sofia University and 8 articles and reports published in peer-reviewed scientific journals, scientific peer-reviewed editions or published in edited collective volumes. Apart from these works, which have not been used in previous competitions from the scientific career of Assoc. Prof. T. Tomova, she additionally applies 1 published book on the basis of a dissertation for awarding the scientific degree "Doctor of Science" - "The Bulgarian path in social policy. History of the transition that does not end ", IM" St. Kl. Ohridski ", (2021), which has a thematic connection with the competition.

All these works of the candidate meet the requirements of the general requirements of the scientific legislator and the specific field of this competition for professor both in volume and content. They are all strictly scientific in nature, method and result. They are printed in highly authoritative publications, many of which are referred to. Without exception, the submitted works fall within the thematic field of the competition. The significant number of publications after obtaining the degree of Doctor of Science is impressive.

In a competition for the teaching academic position of professor, it is normal to take into account the context of the overall research work of the candidate related to the competition topic. Since the beginning of her university career, Dr. Tomova has proved to be a particularly purposeful and prolific scientist both in terms of the amount of work (I mean above all her 6 monographs and at least 28 studies and articles without taking into account other articles and reports at scientific conferences). However, I find that the latest monograph has a special place in this competition, as it covers most of the latest ideas and best presents the achievements and claims of the candidate for professor.

# III. General characteristics of the candidate's research and applied research. III.1. Scientific areas and problems on which the candidate has worked and continues to work.

I find that the issues in Dr. Tomova's works are organized in three-dimensional space. The axes of this space are her conception of the policy process, her conception of the transcendental aspects of the application of public policies, and her conception of social policy. The third area in her analysis captures the other two and is central. Only in this way can the value aspect of modern management be linked in unity with its engineering, something that Dr. Tomova has convincingly proven and developed in recent years. Dealing with the overarching value criterion, as well as striving to find the best tools for assessing policy impact, betrays the richness of her sociological education with its valences to political science, economics and social psychology. In summary, it can be argued that Tomova has been systematically developing for years the theory and management practice of public policies, social policy, the value base of modern governance, justice in the public sphere, impact assessment, socio-psychological elements of public policy, the relationship of the policies with program-project approach and the instrumental rationality of the management through policies in Bulgaria.

Anyone who has been following her analyses for years can confirm that the main merit of Dr. Tomova is the creation of a Bulgarian version of the topic of public and social policy against the background of modern development in this area in view of (a) sustainable development of the public subjects and (b) the national development of Bulgaria - in fact the two faces of the grand strategy of the statehood.

# **III.2.** Characteristics of the applied and realization activity of the candidate

Tatiana Tomova is not a cabinet scientist, although she meets the highest criteria for academicism. Apart from being a researcher and pedagogue, she is at the same time an implementer and popularizer of the topics of social policy and public policies with their tools. Even emphatically her academic works (at least 3 of the monographic studies) have a visible, permanent and diverse connection with management practice.

(a) As a researcher, Dr. Tomova was able to develop in a short time important aspects of the practical foundations of policy-based governance. This fact makes her work especially relevant for the Bulgarian situation, in which a slow and inefficient transformation is taking place in the dark from a classic party-centered "government"

of ministries to modern governance through policies developed by a very wide range of rulers - something Tomova dedicates at least 1 monograph and several studies. Over the years, she has developed numerous curricula for both bachelor's and master's levels, as well as practical courses in scientific management.

(b) As an implementer and promoter of public policy topics, the candidate's creative biography is just as consistent and rich. She has worked for the Center for Strategic Studies of the XXI Century, the National Agency for Child Protection, the Council for Administrative Reform in the Council of Ministers, the Supreme Judicial Council, the European Commission in Bulgaria, UNICEF, the World Bank, two Ministries, the Innovation Fund, 2 State Agencies, foundations and municipalities such as Executive Director, Research Team Leader, Consultant, Expert, Working Group Member, National Expert, Key Expert, etc. As documented, she participates, leads or has managed about 10 projects, some of which are in-depth research in their field. The rest are related to the academic development - development of the Center for Public Policies at Sofia University, editorial boards of famous scientific journals.

# **IV. Citations.**

As about the citations, once this means what is the registered scientific interest in her ideas in Bulgaria and around the world and secondly it means how she uses her scientific apparatus:

(a) From the official reference for the observed citations with full bibliographic description it is clear that the works of Dr. Tomova are cited in a significant number of scientific publications given the average for social sciences in our country, namely: citations in monographs and collective volumes with scientific review - at least 24, citations or reviews in non-refereed journals with scientific review - at least 15, other noticed citations - at least 16, citations in refereed journals - 7 and citations in scientific journals, which are referenced and indexed in world databases - not less than 5. In total, this makes over 67 officially registered citations of the works of Dr. Tomova.

(b) Dr. Tomova defends her theses in a classical way with a well-formed, welldeveloped scientific apparatus with logically complementary sources. They are from the broad field of economics, psychology, sociology, political science, and management sciences, crowned with the surprisingly pertinent presence of philosophy, with which the author seems to allude to that shadowy world of knowledge that unfolds beyond the philosophy of transcendental existence. For example, 135 sources of this type were used in the main monographic study. They all find a place in the analysis, there are no hollow volumes of falsified general professional culture. Of course, the accumulation around some authors is valid for

any study and in this sense Tomova is no exception. The peculiarity, however, is that her favorite quotations are from authors and schools that form a unity. The important thing is that a good logical unison has been obtained. In a sense, I find that the handling of the scientific tools in Dr. Tomova's research is quite original, but at the same time complete.

## V. General characteristics of the pedagogical activity of the candidate.

Associate Professor Tatiana Tomova is a mature university lecturer with a lot of experience, provided the necessary qualities for the highest professorship in this hierarchy. Her research and teaching career is preceded by several years of her research career in Scientific Laboratory for the political life of the Bulgarian. For this reason, Tomova is permanently engaged in teaching as an already formed university staff. Her regular teaching activity began in 1994 at NBU while she was a researcher at the Laboratory at Sofia University. She spent 25 years there as a teacher. He entered Sofia University after a competition for associate professor in 1999, when she became a lecturer in the Department of Public Administration. At the same time, Tomova teaches in other specialties at Sofia University. Currently, Assoc. Prof. Tomova leads courses in the bachelor's and master's programs in Public Administration. The main disciplines taught are 7. All of them are core courses authored by her, read for the first time at the university. They cover the field of the competition, some of them are theoretical and others - practical: Social Policy, EU Policy Making, European Social Policy, Comparative Public Policies, Public Policies, Management of Social Programs. It is obvious that Assoc. Prof. Tomova has a large study load of 400 hours according to the attached documentation. No less important is the fact that she is the author of a university textbook. The textbook is evaluated as an achievement by the management of the educational institution for which it is intended. She has repeatedly been a reviewer in the scientific field of the competition for professor. Her research and teaching work is highly valued at Sofia University, which has been documented.

# VI. Main theoretical and applied contributions.

Dr. Tomova belongs to those Bulgarian scientists who entered in the early years after the transition into new, poorly developed in our country for political reasons areas of social sciences, carrying with them the intellectual baggage of other sciences. Sociology graduate Tatiana Tomova, together with her colleagues, set about pioneering the foundations of important segments of political and administrative science. Thus, she is in the first echelon of the emerging Bulgarian school in the field of political science and management sciences in the 90s of the twentieth century. It is characteristic of all scientists from these groups that they came with their scientific "background" built elsewhere and thus enriched the concepts of politics and governance from the very beginning. In this regard, Dr. Tomova showed serious innovative and creative abilities, and her publications contain quite bold ideas and borrowings from all these areas, defended with the pathos of complementary arguments from different fields of knowledge. These circumstances naturally determine her contributions to the analysis of the relationship between policy and policies. They can be grouped into several areas:

(a) Main contributions:

1. Dr. Tomova has the main merit both to the Bulgarian political science and to the management practice because of the introduction in our country and wide pioneering development of the concept for the public policies. As I have already explained several times, Tomova introduced the basic theories and concepts and developed them in the context of the Bulgarian managerial reality. These are the basic concepts of this scientific paradigm, such as public policies, policy process, communities or policy networks, policy evaluation. All her works are dedicated to this idea.

2. Dr. Tomova successfully modernized the theoretical concept of social policy, sought and explained the characteristics of the development of Bulgarian social policy after the beginning of the changes in 1989 and the path of its development. A large part and at least 1 monographic study are devoted to this task.

3. Dr. Tomova proved the existence and revealed the structural features of the relationship between the modern democratic political regime and the management of public policies. She justified the thesis that policies change the functioning of democracy by strengthening decentralization and modifying it. In this regard, Tomova proved that the modern developed democratic state has become a set of policy processes, fused by the classical representatives of politics and at the same time dispersed due to the presence of various stakeholders in them, along with what is a modern phenomenon observed including in Bulgaria.

4. Dr. Tomova proved in her latest monograph the important position that the classical Weberian-type administration, which dominates the Bulgarian public administration, is not able to be a subject of public policies, as it is process-oriented and not result-oriented - or in Tomova's words, "because it is oriented towards the implementation and application of rules." Policy management requires, above all, the involvement of a network of different stakeholders with a clear focus on innovation and initiative.

5. Dr. Tomova developed a Bulgarian model of the relationship between values and the policy process. This thesis gave her the opportunity to explain the specific choice

of specific goals in management through policies. On this basis, Tomova came to the substantiation of a research methodology of the policy process.

6. Dr. Tomova also created a methodology for developing policies that can be directly applied in practice. For this purpose, Tomova has approached through a creative adaptation to the specific Bulgarian conditions and the specific era, which is characterized by the presence of many stakeholders with different interests and ideas about the general development.

(b) Additional contributions:

1. Dr. Tomova has developed a methodology for policy evaluation based on modern criteria - value attitudes of stakeholders forming policy networks. It justified the need to combine economic and technical assessments with social impact assessments. Tomova analyzes the possible approaches and the relevant indicators that can be used in the evaluation of social policy. She substantiated the thesis that behind the choice of method and indicators for evaluation are hidden values and ideas about the necessary development of the community. The assessment is not neutral. It has lost its purely rational character.

2. Dr. Tomova has contributed greatly to the modernization of the education of management practitioners in the field of public policy, including through her publication "Policy Making, Programs, Projects - A Handbook for Policy Participants" (Bulgarian School of Politics). Its efforts achieve an increase in the capacity of NGOs, strengthening the actions of civil society, public-private partnerships, Roma inclusion, political campaigns, advocacy, policy-making, etc.

3. In several of her works, Dr. Tomova analyzes the change in the social policy of Bulgaria in the late 90's in the light of the concept of "path dependence". Intriguingly, she offers the idea of " path creating " as a concept - a continuation of the famous "path dependence". Along with this, Tomova examines for the first time the impact of policy transfer on the development of social policy in Bulgaria after its full membership in the EU.

Therefore, the following conclusions can be drawn about Dr. Tomova's contributions:

(a) Dr. Tomova formulated a new scientific field and problem;

(b) Dr. Tomova has created a new theory;

(c) Dr. Tomova has created new classifications, methods and methodologies;

(d) Dr. Tomova has contributed to the implementation of new approaches in practice, etc.

(c) Specific significance of the contributions:

to summarize, the contributions of the volume are located on several levels at the same time, although they relate to the overall treatment of policies. this is a novelty in Bulgarian science and has been done in a convincing, complete and multifaceted scientific way.

(d) Realized social effect:

Tomov's theories and methodologies (plural!) on (1) social policy, (2) governance through public policies, and (3) policy impact assessment are too new and have not yet developed as separate paradigms, although Tomova has taken a huge step in that direction. so far it has shown convincingly that it has the potential to have a beneficial effect on society. that is why her ideas have already been used by many authors in our country, which is evident from the number and direction of the impact factor of Dr. Tomova's works.

# VI. Critical notes

To an author's theory, which has achieved its integrity for the first time only recently, and a theory with a strongly interdisciplinary character, which complements not only different scientific fields, but also directions - representatives of different levels of knowledge is as easy as it is hopeless of strong conservative claims from the point of view of one or another dogma. I will not do this because I sympathize with Dr. Tomova's innovative flight, which I want to encourage with my critical remarks. They will not be directed at what I think are signs of logical inconsistencies, such as rarities, missed opportunities or eclecticism. I will limit myself to the following:

First of all, I believe that the division between public policy and social policy must be strictly clarified. There seems to be a staggering social policy to intervene in all sectors. In this regard, Dr. Tomova knows that such a trend is dangerous. However, no clear distinction has been made, although this is very significant. Social policy is just one type of public policy.

Secondly, the question arises, what is the difference between social order and social policy, if it is a state regulation of the highest level - is it (social policy) an instrument for achieving public order? This would be an undesirable and harmful development and the path of analysis in this direction should be clearly blocked by arguments.

Thirdly, the goal-tool difference is perhaps a vulnerable point in the analysis, although Tomova does everything possible to separate them, but the difference remains in fact conditional. The danger of defining almost all political measures as social has not been completely eliminated, despite Tomova's titanic battle with the use of powerful and numerous arguments. There is no defining argument, not a decisive one. The fact that many authors are beginning to write about the responsibility of the state for the individual does not mean that this line goes beyond

the current not very satisfactory state of social policy in most political systems. It should not turn out that social policy is a concept without content because it covers all public policies that are essentially "social". What limits social policy as an intervention - how far is it allowed to invade? What rejects it if it is not, for example, the market?

# VII. Personal impressions and opinion about the candidate's activity.

I have known the pedagogical and research work of the candidate for 30 years. I personally invited her to be a member of the new Department of Public Administration, because I had assessed her value as a lecturer and her value as a specialist in a specific area important for public administration and management and her value as a colleague in a team. I know that he has been a recognized researcher and innovator in the field of public policy, social policy and policy impact assessment for years. In connection with what has been said, I can summarize that, among other things, Assoc. Prof. Tatiana Tomova has always proved to be a loyal colleague and an excellent teacher, which the good universities in Bulgaria deserve. **CONCLUSION:** Given the scientific contributions of the candidate outlined, her active and quality teaching and the need to stimulate the development of modern social, political and managerial theory with a clear connection with the developing practice of the 21st century in the same field of political science I propose the respected jury of this competition to make a decision that Tatiana Trifonova Tomova takes the academic position Professor in Professional Field 3.3 Political Science (Public and Social Policies) announced in SG, issue. 54 of 29.06.2021 for the needs of SU-PhF-Department of Public Administration.

October 12, 2021

**REVIEWER**: