

# OPINION

By Assoc. Prof. Todor Kostadinov Popov, PhD, Faculty of Economics, Sofia University Kliment Ohridski", Professional field 3.8 Economics (Macroeconomic Analysis and Policies, International Macroeconomics /in Bulgarian and English/), promulgated in the State Gazette no. 52 of 02.07.2019

## **A. Candidate №1: Chief Assistant Professor Dimitar Georgiev Zlatinov, PhD**

### **I. Short biography of the applicant.**

Chief Assistant Professor Dimitar Georgiev Zlatinov, PhD, earned his bachelor's degree in economics at the Faculty for Economics and Social Science at Plovdiv University "Paisii Hilendarski", specialty "Macroeconomics" in 2009. At the same faculty in the period 2007-2009 he earned his bachelor's degree in Management, specialty "Business administration". In the period 2009-2010 he earned his first master's degree at the Faculty of Economics of Veliko Turnovo University "St. St. Cyril and Methodius" in collaboration with the Economic Research Institute of the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences – Masters in economics, specialty "International economics relations. International economy".

In the period 2009-2011 he earned his second master's degree in Faculty of Economics and Business Administration, Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski", namely – Masters in economics, specialty "Statistics and financial econometrics". In the period 2011-2015 he is a PhD student at the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski", as he successfully defends his dissertation thesis on the topic "Interaction between fiscal and monetary policy under floating exchange rate and Currency Board Arrangements" and received the scientific and educational degree Doctor in 3.8 Economics (Political economy). Both his bachelor and master degrees, as well as the dissertation of D. Zlatinov are entirely in a field matching the subject of the announced contest, namely – Macroeconomic analysis and policies and International macroeconomics.

In the period 2008-2009 and 2010-2016 D. Zlatinov is subsequently an expert and senior expert in different directorates of BNB, and in 2009-2010 is an expert with the Economic and Social Council. From 2015 until now he is a Chief Assistant Professor at the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski", he is also the Scientific Secretary of the Economics Department at the same faculty, a member of the Faculty Council of the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration, a Director of MP "Customs and tax control" (full-time and part-time study), administrator of MP "Economics and finance" (full-time and part-time study), supervisor of two master's thesis. Parallel with this from 2018 until now he is a Chief Assistant Professor at the Economic Research Institute at the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, "International economics" Section. In line with this after 2011 he is an honorary teacher at the University of National and World Economy and the Plovdiv University "Paisii Hilendarski".

### **II. General characteristics of the scientific and applied production of the applicant.**

1. General description of the presented materials (monographs, textbooks, articles, reports, projects, etc.) in research areas.

For his participation in the competition Chief Assistant Professor Zlatinov has presented altogether 20 publications with a combined volume of 672 pages. These publications are as follows:

- Habitational work (equal standing publication) – 1 standalone monograph with a volume of 156 pages;

- Standalone chapters in three other monographies, which are not presented as core habitation work (equal standing publication) with a combined volume of 87 pages;
- 1 study guide (co-author) with a volume of 196 pages;
- 8 papers in scientific journals – with a combined volume of 96 pages;
- 4 publications in scientific series – with a combined volume of 96 pages;
- 3 publications – reports in different collections – with a combined volume of 41 pages.

Viewing of the pointed out publications for participation in the contest leads to the conclusion that practically all (maybe with the exception of publication № 20 – Application of the Diamond-Mortensen-Pissarides model to the situation on the labor market in Bulgaria), are in the field of macroeconomics and international economics, which are also a subject of the current contest.

From the introduced for participation in the contest 20 publications of Chief Assistant Professor Dimitar Zlatinov 10 are in English (9 papers and 2 reports), 1 is in Russian, and the rest are in Bulgarian. Introduction to the publications of the candidate leads to the conclusion that they do not repeat publications used for acquiring the educational and scientific degree “doctor”. 5 of the publications – 2 chapters of standalone monographies, a study guide, 1 paper and 1 report are co-authored. Separation protocols have been applied for all collective publications.

In conclusion to this general characteristic it should be pointed out that all data for the contest participation of candidate D. Zlatinov are supported by duly attached documents, including scientific works in accordance with the requirements from the Act for the Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria, the Rulebook for its application and the appropriate Rulebook of SU. In addition, these documents have been enclosed in the form required by the mentioned normative acts – 8 copies in both written and PDF format.

## 2. General characteristics of the applicant's scientific, applied and teaching activities.

The main emphasis in the publications of Chief Assistant Professor Dimitar Zlatinov is on Macroeconomic Issues, incl. international, economic growth, business cycles and the international economy.

It is evident from the information provided only at the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration of Sofia University “St. Kliment Ohridski” that Dimitar Zlatinov is a lecturer in the courses in "Macroeconomics I", "Macroeconomics II", "International Economics" and “International Economic Relations”, and to a lesser extent also in the disciplines Microeconomics I, Applied Economic Analysis and Macroeconomic Policy. For the previous 4 academic years, his teaching load was 270, 480, 525 and 567 hours per year, respectively – or a total of 1842 hours only at the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration at the Sofia University with a minimum required according to the Additional Requirements of the same Faculty 800. Details of his academic load in another universities where D. Zlatinov is a part-time lecturer are not represented. With regard to teaching, it should be emphasized that all major disciplines in which he teaches are those that are fully covered by the contest, namely Macroeconomic Analysis and Policies and International Macroeconomics.

For the period 2007-2019 the applicant has participated in 6 research and education projects. 4 of the projects are in the teams of PU "Paisii Hilendarski", and in 2 are a member of the project team of ERI at BAS.

### III. Quantitative characteristics of the applicant's scientific production.

The statement for meeting the minimum requirements of the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration of Sofia University “St. Kliment Ohridski” for the academic position “Associate

Professor" in PF 3.8 Economics from Chief Assistant Professor D. Zlatinov shows that with a minimum score of 400 points, he scores a total of 614 points as follows:

Indicator group A. Dissertation thesis for the award of educational and scientific degree "Doctor": 50 points.

Indicator Group B - There is no Doctor of Science dissertation.

Indicator group C. Habilitation work - 1 monograph: 100 points.

Indicator Group D:

D1 - Papers and reports published in scientific journals, abstracted and indexed in world-renowned scientific information databases - 1 paper - 30 points;

D2 - Studies published in scientific journals, referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases of scientific information - 1 studies - 45 points;

D3 - Articles and reports published in scientific journals, non-refereed journals with scientific peer review or published in edited collective volumes - 6 publications - 55 points in total;

D4 - Studies published in scientific journals, non-refereed scientific peer-reviewed journals or in published collective volumes - 7 publications - 96 points in total;

D5 - Collected chapters from collective monographs - 3 chapters - 39 points.

Total by group of indicators D - 265 points.

Indicator Group E:

E1 - Citations or reviews in scientific publications, abstracted and indexed in world-renowned scientific information databases or in monographs and collective volumes - 1 citation - 15 points;

E2 - Citations in monographs and collective volumes with scientific review - 3 citations - a total of 30 points;

E3 - Citations or reviews in non-refereed scientific peer-reviewed journals - 12 citations - 60 points in total;

Total by group of indicators D - 105 points.

Metric group E.

E1 - participation in 4 national scientific or educational projects - 60 points in total.

E2 - 1 participation in an international scientific or educational project - 20 points.

E3 - Published university textbook or school textbook used in the school network - 1 pc. in co-authorship - 14 points

Total by group of indicators E - 94 points.

Thus, the total number of points of the candidate in the above indicators is 614 points.

It is noteworthy that the required Reference under Article 2b of the ZRASRB was correctly filled in by the candidate D. Zlatinov.

The above information shows that the candidate for the academic position "Associate Professor" participates in the contest with publications, which significantly exceed the minimum requirements specified in Appendix No. 1 to Art. 1a, para 1 - District 3, Table 1 of the Regulations for the implementation of the ZRASRB.

It should also be noted that the calculation of the above indicators did not take into account the study activity of the applicant - lectures and exercises given by him, supervision of master's thesis and management and administration of master's programs, some of them are given above when the applicant submits.

#### **IV. Evaluation of the applicant's results and scientific input**

The scientific publications of Chief Assistant Professor D. Zlatinov can be divided into three thematic groups: macroeconomic analysis and policies, international economics and teaching economic theory. Within these topics, which coincide with the subject of the announced contest, contributions and/or innovations with theoretical and practical ones can be highlighted. I find that the relevant Report submitted by the applicant correctly presents these contributions or novelties.

#### **V. Assessment of the originality of the submitted works and the reliability of the scientific data presented**

The publications of Chief Assistant Professor Zlatinov is devoted to important problems related to macroeconomic analysis and policies and the international economy. All these issues are analyzed in depth at both theoretical and empirical levels.

By a self-signed declaration, the candidate in the contest for the academic position of "Associate Professor" declares that there is no proven plagiarism in his scientific works. I also believe that the publications provided are the personal work of the author, are original and do not contain elements of plagiarism.

### **B. Candidate №2: Chief Assistant Professor Pavel Todorov Stoynov**

#### **I. Short biography of the applicant**

Chief Assistant Professor Pavel Stoynov has obtained master's degrees in Mathematics at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski" in 1996 and in Computer Engineering - at the Technical University, also in 1996. The documents presented in electronic form do not contain information on his bachelor's degree, which is probably also obtained at the Sofia University. In 2000 he also obtained a master's degree in Business Administration from Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski".

In the period 2012 - 2015 he is a PhD student at the Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski", successfully defending his dissertation thesis on the state and development of health tourism in Bulgaria and receiving his scientific and educational degree Doctor of Professional Studies 4.4 - Earth Sciences. In the period 2015-2017 he completed his doctoral program at the University for National and World Economy in the professional field of 3.8 (Defense and Security Economics) and in 2017 he defended his dissertation thesis on "Flood Risk Analysis".

It is noteworthy that both the master's degrees and the topics of the two doctoral dissertation thesis of P. Stoynov are entirely in areas far removed from the subject of the announced contest, namely Macroeconomic Analysis and Policies and International Macroeconomics. One dissertation is initially in another professional field and the other is in problems close to microeconomics and especially econometrics.

In the period 1992-2000 P. Stoynov was a part-time Assistant Professor of Mathematics at Sofia University and the Technical University, and after 2000 he was an assistant professor at the Faculty of Economics of Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski ". As long as he only indicated in his electronic resume that he was still an Assistant Professor, and according to the information from the administration of the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration he was a Chief Assistant Professor, he could be assumed to be acquired the latter in the period after 2017.

## II. General characteristics of the scientific and applied production of the applicant

1. General description of the submitted materials (monographs, textbooks, articles, reports, projects, etc.) by research area.

For participation in the contest Stoynov has presented publications whose volume and even number cannot be evaluated. For example in electronic format there is one file with 16 abstracts of papers and scientific messages. A second list of 48 papers and scientific messages, 3 study guides and 1 monograph has been presented, which is stated to be not even printed but is in the process of being drafted. This second list indicates that these are publications that are not related to the doctorate degree, but it is not clear whether they are intended for participation in the contest. The enclosed electronic CV contains a third list of publications related to the doctorate degree. Attached is the fourth list of 15 publications (papers and scientific messages) intended for participation in the contest. Insofar as it can be inferred from this list alone, the 15 publications cited, 1 of which are co-authored, have a total volume of 127 pages. A separate protocol for co-authored publication is at least not electronically presented. Of the publications included in this list (as far as one can judge from the titles and abstracts), 2 (under Nos. 13 and 15) are in the field of macroeconomics, and the rest are in the field of statistics and econometrics and partly in microeconomics.

As for the above three books, presented in one paper copy, 2 of them are publications of the two PhD dissertations of the applicant and cannot be evaluated for participation in the contest. The third book, which is written in a manuscript with an "additional monograph", is entitled "Additive Processes in Finance". Similar to other publications for the contest, it is quite far from the topic of the contest, since it is also in the field of econometrics and partly - microeconomics.

As text, none of these publications is presented in the form required by Art. 107, para 2 of the Rules on the Terms and Conditions for Acquisition of Academic Degrees and Occupation of Academic Positions at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski " in connection with Art. 47, para. 2 of the Rules for the Implementation of the ZRARB. Visually, we found that the administration of the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration has a folder with copies of publications and documents in hard copy, as well as 3 books (in 1 copy, also in hard copy).

If we group these publications, we get the following information:

- Habilitation work (equivalent publication) - **it has not been established, not only in electronic form, but also in paper form.** We assume that the applicant was referring to the monograph mentioned at the end of the second list of the above 4 monographs, for which he himself wrote that he was in the process of completion, whatever that means;

- Published monograph not listed as major habilitation work - 1 with a volume of 204 pages;
- 3 study guides - in statistics, insurance mathematics and probability theory, their volume is not clear since they are not presented electronically;
- 15 papers and scientific reports - with a total volume of 127 pages;
- 48 publications unrelated to the acquisition of the doctoral degree and partially corresponding to the 15 publications for the contest.

A review of the aforementioned publications for participation in the contest leads to the conclusion that practically all of them (except for the two publications mentioned above) are in the field of microeconomics and econometrics, with only two of them being the subject of this contest.

Since there are only 1 in the above lists, whose title is in Bulgarian, and given the lack of electronic publications themselves, it cannot be firmly concluded how many of them are written in Bulgarian and how many are written in another language. We did not find any split protocols applied to co-authored posts.

In conclusion of this general characteristic it should be noted that the assessment of the production of the candidate P. Stoynov is very difficult both because it is not presented in the type required by the normative acts, and due to the fact that both the publications in the overwhelming part and the textbook the applicant's activities do not fit into the subject of the announced contest. The same can be said about the other documents required by law - copies of diplomas, a certificate of criminal record, precise information on what disciplines does his/her academic activity, etc.

## 2. General characteristics of the applicant's scientific, applied and teaching activities.

The main emphasis in the publications of Chief Assistant Professor P Stoynov is on problems of macroeconomics, insurance mathematics and national security. Some of the publications are on topics related to tourism, geo-economics and mathematics.

For the period 2007-2019 the applicant has participated in 2 university and 2 national projects (Certification of SPAs and Wellness Centers and Student Practices), and according to another report - 3 projects. Documents from the respective collectives for participation in these projects were not submitted at least electronically.

### **III. Quantitative characteristics of the applicant's scientific production**

Measuring the quantitative indicators of P. Stoynov's application is very difficult, both due to the fact that they are not presented in the legal order, and because with two exceptions they are on topics other than the subject of the competition.

The statement for meeting the minimum requirements of the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski" for the academic position "Associate Professor" in PF 3.8 Economics from Chief Assistant P. Stoynov shows that with a minimum score of 400 points, he scores a total of 650 points as follows:

Indicator group A. Dissertation thesis for the award of educational and scientific degree "Doctor": 50 points.

Indicator Group B - There is no Doctor of Science dissertation.

Indicator group C. Habilitation work - in the completed electronic reference form the applicant has indicated 1 monograph bearing 100 points under this item. As mentioned, no publications were

submitted electronically. I did not find a habilitation work (monograph) to be presented even in a paper form. There is no such publication also in the fourth list of publications. For these reasons, and in the most favorable to the candidate ratio, **those 100 points cannot be added to the total number.**

Indicator Group D:

D1 - Published book based on doctoral thesis - 2 books - 75 total points;

D2 - Papers and reports in non-refereed journals - 15 papers - a total of 150 points. However, one of the submitted papers is co-authored with no separation protocol presented, this number should be reduced to the interval 141-149 points;

D3 - Published monograph that is not a major habilitation work - 1 pc. – 100 points;

Total by group of indicators D - 325, respectively. 316-324 points.

Indicator Group E:

E1 - Citations or reviews in scientific publications, abstracted and indexed in world-famous scientific information databases or in monographs and collective volumes - 3 citations - a total of 45 points;

E2 - Citations or reviews in non-refereed scientific peer-reviewed journals - 2 citations - 10 points in total;

Total by group of indicators D - 55 points.

Metric group E.

E1 - participation in 3 projects - 60 points in total. Here we also notice an inaccuracy since according to Table 2 of Region 3 of Annex 1 to Art. 1a, para. 1 of the RBMPRB participation in a national project brings 15, not 20 points. Therefore, if the projects are 3, as indicated in the Report, they should bring 45 points.

E2 - Published university textbook or school textbook used in the school network - 3 pcs. - 60 points in total.

Total by group of indicators E - 105 points.

**Thus, the total number of points reported by the candidate in the above indicators is 650 points. In the absence of basic habilitation work, as well as in compliance with the scoring established by the PPZRASRB, this number is a maximum of 534 points.**

In strict adherence to the formal requirements of the law and the relevant regulations of the 650 points so reported by the candidate, 45 points in E1, 55 points in E and 50 points in A, or 150 points in total, should be counted. The formal requirements and the fact that only 2 of the publications are on topics related to the contest, the candidate P. Stoynov can theoretically be awarded no more than 534 points.

It should also be noted that the calculation of the above indicators (similar to the candidate D. Zlatinov) did not consider the educational activity of the candidate - lectures and exercises he conducted, supervision of master's theses and management and administration of master's programs and others. Some of them are given above when the applicant submits. The difference in this respect between the two candidates is that in the first study activity is in disciplines, almost all of which are in the topic of the contest, and in the second - in disciplines outside this topic.

#### **IV. Evaluation of the applicant's results and scientific input**

The scientific contributions of Chief Assistant Professor P. Stoynov is presented in the information presented by him and is again in areas other than the topic of the contest.

#### **V. Assessment of the originality of the submitted works and the reliability of the scientific data presented**

A self-signed declaration stating that the candidate in the academic position "Associate Professor" declares that there is no proven plagiarism in his scientific works has not been submitted electronically and may be presented in paper form. I personally believe that the publications provided are the personal work of the author, are original and do not contain elements of plagiarism.

#### **CONCLUSION**

Considering the materials provided, the subject matter, the quantity and the quality of the publications, the contributions, as well as the fulfillment of the additional indicators for teaching and research activity, and as I relate them to the conditions of the announced competition and the way they are presented, I firmly express my opinion on the ranking of the candidates according to its overall assessment of compliance with the announced contest for Associate Professor in the professional field 3.8 Economics (Macroeconomic Analysis and Policies, International Macroeconomics /in Bulgarian and English/) at the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration at the University as follows:

1. Chief Assistant Professor Dimitar Georgiev Zlatinov
2. Chief Assistant Professor Pavel Todorov Stoynov

**For the foregoing reasons, I can confidently recommend that the Scientific Jury propose to the Faculty Council of the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski " to choose Chief Assistant Professor Dimitar Georgiev Zlatinov, PhD, at the Academic position of Associate Professor at PF 3.8 Economics (Macroeconomic Analysis and Policies, International Macroeconomics /in Bulgarian and English/).**

10/18/2019

Jury Member: .....

(Assoc. Prof. Dr. T. Popov)