

REVIEW

by Prof. ROSSITSA RANGELOVA PAVLOVA, Dr.Ec.Sc.
Economic Research Institute at the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences,
Professional direction 3.8. Economics:
Dr.Ec.Sc.- subject “Statistics and Demography”, and
Professor - subject “World Economy and International Economic Relations”

of the materials for the competition for the occupation of the academic position "Associate Professor"

1. Contest information

The competition is for the academic position of Assistant Professor in the professional direction 3.8. Economics (Macroeconomic Analysis and Policies, International Macroeconomics - in Bulgarian and English), published in State Gazette: issue № 52/02.07.2019, based on Art. 7 of the Rules on the Terms and Conditions for Acquisition of Academic Degrees and Occupation of Academic Positions at Sofia University “St. Kliment Ohridski”. The competition is for the needs of the Department of Economics, under decision to announce the competition № 10/29.05.2019 of the Academic Council of the Faculty of Economics and Order of the Rector of Sofia University " St. Kliment Ohridski" № RD 38-460 / 26.07.2019.

The documents of two candidates have been submitted for participation in the competition: Chief Assistant Dr. Dimitar Georgiev Zlatinov and Chief Assistant Dr. Pavel Todorov Stoynov - both from the Faculty of Economics at Sofia University “St. Kliment Ohridski ”- hereinafter they will be briefly mentioned only with their scientific degree. The documents presented by Dr. Dimitar Zlatinov have been prepared in accordance with the requirements of the Law on Academic Staff Development in the Republic of Bulgaria (LASDRB) for the occupation of the academic position “Associate Professor” and the recommendations for criteria for occupation of the academic positions in the Faculty of Economics of Sofia University “St. Kliment Ohridski ”. Dr. Pavel Stoynov's documents do not meet the necessary criteria.

2. Brief biography

2.1. Dimitar Zlatinov was born in 1987. He received the bachelor's degree at the Faculty of Economic and Social Sciences at the University of Plovdiv “Paisii Hilendarski”, subject Macroeconomics and Business Management (2005-2009), followed by two master's programs: "International Economic Relations. International Economics" at the Faculty of Economics of VTU and the Institute of Economics at the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences (2009-2010) - jointly program and" Statistics and Financial Econometrics" at the Faculty of Economics of Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski” (2009-2011). In 2015 he defended at Sofia University a thesis for receiving the scientific degree Doctor of Economics (PhD) on the topic "Interaction between Fiscal and Monetary Policy at Floating Exchange Rate and in Monetary Board Conditions". The following three programs: at the BNB, state and municipal institutions (2007-2008), trainings and seminars such as those at the European Court of Auditors, Luxembourg - on measuring social progress, economic development and well-being (2010) enhanced his professional training as well as those at University of National and World Economics (UNWE) - Sofia (2013); IMF, Joint Vienna Institute, Macroeconomic Process Diagnosis Course, 2014; Czech National Bank (2014), and participation in several scientific projects. He has worked consequently as a BNB

expert (2008-2009), at the Economic and Social Council (2009-2010) and as a senior BNB expert from (2010-2016). From 2010 to 2016 he was Assistant Professor, and from 2016 up to now Chief Assistant at the Economics Department of the Faculty of Economics at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski". He is Lecturer in Macroeconomics, International Economics and Business Policy and Assistant in Macroeconomics II. Since 2018, he is Chief Assistant in the International Economics Section at the Economic Research Institute, Bulgarian Academy of Sciences. All these facts presents the candidate as a person who has consistently made intensive efforts to obtain quality education and complete creative realization on the topic set in this competition for the occupation of the academic position "Associate Professor".

2.2. Pavel Stoynov was born in 1971. From 1991 until recently, he received education at various universities and in various disciplines. As a result, he has obtained the following educational and scientific degrees: Master of Mathematics at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski" (1996); Master's degree in Computer Engineering at the Technical University – Sofia (1996); Master of Business Administration at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski" (2000); Doctor of Earth Sciences at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski" (2015) and Doctor of Economics, University of National and World Economics (2017). For his professional experience, he has pointed out his position of (part-time) assistant from 2000 up to now at the Faculty of Economics of Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski". There is no data on when he became Chief Assistant. Pavel Stoynov points a position of Assistant in Mathematics at the Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski" and TU-Sofia, 1992-2000 and assistant at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski", Faculty of Economics - since 2000 - until today. Questions arise as to how he fulfilled it since 1992, having received the relevant degree later (1996). There is also no information on the level of knowledge of foreign languages. A wide range of overly diverse scientific interests has been declared (24 in number), which raises questions about the seriousness and depth of knowledge. Almost all of them, even just stated ones, such as geography, tourism, mathematics, databases, software applications, operating systems and more, are far from the topics of macroeconomic analysis and international macroeconomics.

3. Compliance with the minimum national requirements under Art. 26 of LASDRB

3.1 According to the reference for implementation of the minimum national requirements under Art. 26 of the LASDRB, scientific field 3.8. Economics for the occupation of the academic position "Associate Professor" the candidate Dr. Dimitar Zlatinov covers and even considerably exceeds the quantitative criteria - at a minimum of 300 he has 614, including: indicators from group A, dissertation awarding of the National Doctorate degree - 50 points; from group B, rehabilitation work, monograph - 100; from Group D, publications (studies, articles, reports, etc.) in different rank and type of scientific publications, in accordance with the National Reference List of Contemporary Bulgarian Scientific Publications with Scientific Review as of July 1, 2019) - 265; from group D, citations and reviews in scientific publications - 105 and from group E, participation in a scientific or educational project - 94. The evidence is described clearly, completely and unambiguously.

I would like to point out the meticulous presentation of the materials for participation in the competition by Dr. Dimitar Zlatinov: absolutely complete set, fully and correctly described, sufficient volume and content of abstracts of publications (in Bulgarian and English) and availability of all his scientific output.

3.2 In the document entitled "Quantitative Requirements for Occupation of Academic Positions in the Faculty of Economics of Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski "(professional directions 3.8" Economics" and 3.7 "Administration and Management") Dr. Pavel Stoynov describes the reasons for their introduction (which is not necessary for the Scientific Jury). This is followed by a mixed and vague description of the applicant's scientific output. It is only declarations of the main activities, colored in green, for which it is not clear where they came from. It is not possible to assess whether the applicant fulfills the compulsory three conditions for participation in the competition: "Doctor", for which no document has been attached, no period of the post of Chief Assistant with an official note, as well as a published monograph or "equivalent" publications in specialized scientific journals, which do not repeat those submitted for the doctoral degree.

4. General characteristics of the submitted scientific papers/publications

4.1 A list of all publications by Dr. Dimitar Zlatinov has been provided. They are 43 in number and are grouped as follows: monograph - 1, chapter of monograph - 8 in number; textbook /study assignment - 2; publications in scientific journals - 9; publications in scientific series - 11; publications in collections (from conferences, etc.) - 12. They are described in the most complete and correct way so that a clear idea of the candidate's overall scientific production is obtained. Of particular interest is the list of his publications in connection with the announced competition for the academic position of associate professor. They are described in the same complete and correct way with the indicated publishers, pages and ISSN. The publications are 20 in total (and the total volume of the candidate 552 pages, counting the own pages in publications co-authored on the basis of the applied separation protocols) and are arranged as follows: 1 stand-alone monograph (156 pages) and three participations in collective monographs (47 pages); 1 textbook co-authored (of 196 pages total 124 pages of the applicant); publications in scientific journals - 8 (101 pages); publications in scientific series - 4 in number (86 pages); publications in proceedings from conferences, etc. - 3 in number (38 pages). The applicant's individual publications are 15 in number and 5 are co-authored, which shows good self-expression, but also an opportunity to work in a team; 10 publications are in Bulgarian, 1 in Russian and 9 in English.

Systematized, the publications of Dr. Dimitar Zlatinov give reason to make the following summaries:

Firstly, the applicant has sufficient scientific output in terms of volume and subject matter to participate fully in the announced competition.

Secondly, his scientific interests and teaching activity are mainly in the field of macroeconomic analysis and policies, as well as international macroeconomics, which is fully in line with the subject of the announced competition for the academic position of Associate Professor in the Department of Economics.

Thirdly, the scientific works have been published in thematically appropriate and authoritative publishers and journals in Bulgaria, such as: the editions of Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski ", of the Institute for Economic Research at the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, of the UNWE, of the Paisii Hilendarski University of Plovdiv, and others.

Fourthly, nearly half of his scholarly works is in English at national and international publishers and journals, which speaks to the active pursuit of contemporary international criteria

for wider dissemination of the author's scholarly publications as an opportunity for broader dialogue and collaboration with the colleagues outside our country.

4.2 Dr. Pavel Todorov Stoynov has submitted several files with different numbers of publications. One of them contains all his publications that he has, the other is in the "Authors" system, the third is the publications with which he participates in the competition, which is repeated with the file Attachment1. In the file entitled "Scientific contributions of Dr. Pavel Stoynov, generated by the Authors system - a list of publications, conferences, projects and scientific guides, there is a description of the topics of all possible works of the candidate - thesis, dissertations, reports of conferences, monographs, scientific projects, scientific articles, etc., but they have nothing to do with the competition and those that have been already listed elsewhere. They are unordered and without proof of actual participation in the projects and writing of scientific articles. NACID requires a full description. I object to our accumulation of unnecessary information and lack of necessary information. There are probably (or should have) requirements for the applicants' documents before submitting for the competition.

In this case, I consider one of the files which as it is written, is "for the occupation of the academic position of Associate Professor" in the professional direction 3.8 Economics (Macroeconomic Analysis and Policies, International Macroeconomics - in Bulgarian and English) for the needs of the Faculty of Economics. He is the only author of these publications except one, which is in co-authorship. They have an average size of 8.7 pages (the smallest are 3 pages long, and the largest one is 30 pages). They are written in English, even those that are published in Bulgarian, which is incorrect. They are not arranged by some criteria - chronological, thematic, types of scientific works - monographs, participation in collective monographs, studies, articles, conference reports, etc. In another file, as it reads, "excluding publications related to the PhD/"Doctor", there is a list of 48 publications, 3 scientific aids (in statistics, insurance mathematics and probability theory) and one monograph which... not yet is finished and should not logically be pointed. A monograph is mentioned, which carries 100 points, but it is nowhere to be seen, even only a title described as a habilitation work or as an abstract. These posts are subject to the same spelling features that I described for the previous file. The abstracts of the publications (actually first lines of the publications are copy-pasted) are incomplete and incorrectly given. The publications themselves are missing, and according to the Rules of the Sofia University, Art. 107 (16.) the applicant is obliged to submit "scientific papers for participation in the competition, structured and numbered according to the list under item 10b." This greatly complicates the perception of the volume and nature of the applicant's scientific output. In addition, most importantly, the topics of the publications are on drastically different topics than those set in the macroeconomics and international economics competition. Moreover, in the Rules of the Sofia University, it is said: Art. 105. (1) The academic position "Associate Professor" shall be filled by persons who... ..3. have submitted published monographs or equivalent publications in specialized scientific publications *in the field of competition...* "(the italic is mine – RR) .

5. Evaluation of scientific works and their contributions

5.1 The greatest interest in the production of Dr. Dimitar Zlatinov is undoubtedly his monograph (No. 1 on the list) "Macroeconomic Policy in Bulgaria after the Introduction of the Currency

Board (from theoretical to applied analysis)" (2019), which is the habilitation work. It examines very important and topical issues of macroeconomic policy in Bulgaria in the specific conditions of the currency board and as an EU Member State over a relatively long period of time (2000-2018). The main thesis, which is proven, is that despite the imposed fiscal rules from the country's EU membership and from the country's current currency board since 1997 the government "are pursuing a discretionary and counter-cyclical fiscal policy which, however, is of low efficiency and cannot have real impact to accelerate catching-up economic development '(p. 6). The main contributions are as follows. The monograph is an original study that employs an econometric (formalized) approach to assessing the relationships and interactions between multiple macroeconomic variables, distinguished in both fiscal and monetary policies. It is a clear theoretical proof and an exemplary illustration of the deep interconnectedness of macroeconomic indicators emerging through certain channels.

For the needs of the educational process and the lectures delivered at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski " Dr. Dimitar Zlatinov has published a study guide on International Economics (2019), which is intended for students of the Faculty of Economics at Sofia University" St. Kliment Ohridski "in bachelor's and master's degrees. It includes basic theoretical knowledge in international trade, international finance and the international macroeconomics. The ideas of world's leading scientists on the topic such as Paul Krugman and Maurice Obstfeld are reflected in the textbook, as well as of Bulgarian economists. Attached is the original structure of the textbook - after presentation of a certain topic, it is possible to choose the right alternative in theoretical texts, as well as test questions and practical tasks for self-preparation. This is a hallmark of a modern teaching and dialogue style with students that facilitates the students, PhD students, and others seeking knowledge in the field. My little note about this work is the authors' desire to show followers and less known of the various economics schools and whether in some cases this is not at the expense of the leading names, which should be the first - Adam Smith, for example).

I accept Dr. Dimitar Zlatinov's original scientific contributions, which are in the field of macroeconomic analysis and policies, international macroeconomics and the teaching of economic theory. This topic is fully covered by the competition announced. The contributions have a theoretical, scientific and applied nature and are related to the educational process. They are described clearly, completely and according to established criteria. Briefly, I would summarize like that:

The contributions of a theoretical nature concern the justification of the specifics of research and implementation of macroeconomic policy (Publication 1 of the corresponding list); a theoretical overview of theories and concepts on the relationship between demographic and economic development (Publication No. 13); The macroeconomic effects of the global financial and economic crisis in Bulgaria have been discovered and systematized (Publications No 2, No 4, No 10 and No 11).

Contributions of a methodological (scientific and applied) nature: modeling of the transmission mechanism of fiscal and monetary policy in the short and long term, taking into account the peculiarities of the currency board and Bulgaria's membership in the EU (Publication No. 1); development of the possibilities for expanding the analytical applicability of the Mundel-Fleming model for studying the effectiveness of fiscal and monetary policy under different currency regimes and its applicability has been demonstrated (Publication No. 15) and more.

Contributions related to the educational process: techniques have been developed for how university economic education can develop cognitive potential and professional competence; (Publications Nos. 7 and 9), etc.

The author writes at a good professional level, clear and competent style.

Everywhere the author has cited correctly used literature sources.

5.2 I do not accept the Dr. Pavel Stoynov reference on his scientific works contributions. Common one-line phrases are listed, such as "Applied research on tourism demand and supply" and a list of publications has been attached. Only 9 publications are given, suggesting that in the other 6 out of 15, there is probably no contribution from the candidate. No need to present two files with the same information. In addition, as already noticed, the titles of the publications are at very different and distant topics from the one set in this competition.

6. Participation in research projects

6.1 Dr. Dimitar Zlatinov participates in the competition with five research projects (2 national, 2 university and 1 international), which are thematically responsive to the announced competition for the academic position of Associate Professor. These include the following ones: (1) Preparation of a National Energy Strategy, Activity IA "Electricity Consumption Estimates by 2040" and Action III "Investigating the Trends in the Energy Markets in Europe and Bulgaria's Potential to Continue Exporter of Electricity", Economic Research Institute at the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, 2017-2018; (2) Challenges and Barriers to Deepening the Integration Processes for the Newly Admitted EU Member States / the case of Bulgaria /. Plovdiv University "Paisii Hilendarski"; (3) Developing an Early Warning Framework for Crisis Detection in Economic Sectors in Bulgaria. Korea Development Institute and Economic Research Institute at the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, 2019-2020. The involvement in such serious projects undoubtedly enriches his knowledge and experience in linking the theoretical and practical aspects.

6.2. Due to the vague description by Dr. Pavel Stoynov of participating in research and any other projects, I do not engage to comment on them. There are certainly no scientific projects on the topic announced in the competition.

7. Assessment of the teaching activity

7.1 An official note on the teaching employment of Dr. Dimitar Zlatinov is attached. According to it, for the last 4 academic years the total number of classroom hours is 1842 (equated to exercises), increasing steadily and significantly by years - from 270 for the academic year 2015/2016 to 567 hours for 2018/2019, which shows the increasing need for him as a faculty. The subjects taught are (without pretensions and exhaustiveness requirements): Microeconomics I - first and second part, Macroeconomics I - first and second part, Fundamentals of Macroeconomics, Applied Macroeconomic Analysis, International Economics, International Economic Relations, Business Policy in the subject Economics and Finance - English and French program, Business Administration - English, German and French program, Master Programme of Applied Economics, Master Programme of Economy and Finance, etc. All these disciplines are fully in line with the scientific direction 3.8. Economics and the specialty in which the competition for the academic position of Associate Professor - Macroeconomics and International Macroeconomics has been announced. In addition, Dr. Dimitar Zlatinov has been a part-time lecturer in International Economics and Applied Economic Analysis, Assistant Professor in Macroeconomics at the Faculty of Economic and Social Sciences, Plovdiv University "Paisii Hilendarski" (2011-2018) and a part-time lecturer in Macroeconomics at the General Economics Faculty at UNWE.

The teaching activity described above, together with the teaching aids issued, present the applicant as a trained and qualified teacher, suitable to continue and develop their experience on a new quality level.

7.2 Dr. Pavel Stoynov has submitted a file entitled "Reference to the Indicators under Article 112, para. 2 ", but what this article means is not spelled out to understand its meaning. It is from the Rules of the Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski", where is written "The Scientific Jury evaluates the candidates for the academic position" Associate Professor ", as para. 2. is "research related". In fact, the candidate has attempted to describe rather para. 1. "related to the learning activity". It turned out to be very strange as a description and because it is short, I was tempted to quote it here, but it is in the candidate's documents and anyone can see there. Still, an example: "Many years of experience as an assistant with several thousand hours of classroom teaching." These and other similar claims are written declaratively, and they cannot be accepted in this way and without an official note attached. It ends with "Reviewirani (!?) several hundred articles in Mathreview and Zentralblat." There are no word reviewirani in the Bulgarian language, and the submitted magazines and without addresses do not say anything.

8. Scientific and administrative commitment

8.1 As a member of the Department of Economics Dr. Dimitar Zlatinov is a scientific secretary and a member of the Faculty Board of the Faculty of Economics (from 2018), an administrator of the Master Programme of Economy and Finance (since 2018) and head of the Master Programme of Customs and Tax Control (since 2019).

8.2. There is no evidence that Dr. Pavel Stoynov has held any administrative posts in the field of higher education.

9. Citations or reviews in scientific publications

9.1 Dr. Dimitar Zlatinov proves availability of a total of 16 citations, incl. in world-renowned databases of scientific information or in monographs and collective volumes; in monographs and peer-reviewed scientific peer-reviewed volumes and in non-refereed scientific peer-reviewed journals. The applicant's 8 publications are cited in Bulgarian and 8 in English language. The 16 citations are cited in 11 publications in Bulgarian and 5 in English. Both types of publications (cited and citing) are described in full and correct, including the pages on which the citation is referenced, as well as ISSN/ISBN. I would like to draw attention to the fact that, by standard, the cited publication should be described first and then the citation(s), but not in the reverse order, as is this case. The number of citations is sufficient to participate in the competition. Due to the fact that the majority of the candidate's publications are from the last two years (and new ones on important economic topics are yet to come), his publications will surely receive more and more attention.

9.2 Dr. Pavel Stoynov cites an article that has been cited in two journals related to hydrology, too far from macroeconomics. This is not enough. There are no parameters for the magazines - DOI, ISSN, ISBN, and their authenticity cannot be traced. The correct description is a requirement of NACID, and a mark of professional culture. This applies to all lists of his publications. It is not

clear which other three quotations the candidate cites in the excel file. This file should be completed extensively, and not so incompletely. So it does not inspire confidence and interest.

10. Critical notes and recommendations

10.1 I have no critical criticisms of Dr. Dimitar Zlatinov. I have recommendations. To continue his well-started professional development in the scientific and teaching fields; further deepening his involvement in international scientific events or contacts with the aim of enriching his own experience and presenting the faculty, following the constantly rising international standards.

10.2. I have many critical remarks to Dr. Pavel Stoynov. I will briefly summarize them in two main points:

1. Presentation and preparation of documents. There is no evidence such as diplomas, teaching certificates, full-text publications, abstracts on some of these publications are not seriously submitted. It is inadmissible to submit for review such incomplete and poorly described documents that make it difficult to understand the facts on his professional development.

2. I wonder what are the ideas of Dr. Pavel Stoynov about the necessary scientific potential of a candidate to participate in the announced competition in the professional direction 3.8. Economics, Macroeconomic Analysis and Policies, International Macroeconomics. How does he actually imagine that he covers it and how can become fully involved in this position?

11. Overall conclusion:

11.1 Dr. Dimitar Zlatinov has a distinct scientific profile as a researcher and lecturer in the field of macroeconomics and international economics. It is presented with sufficient volume, content and contributions of scientific works. His scientific contributions are the result of his research on the topic announced in the competition. The candidate successfully combines research, teaching and applied activities on the particular subject, which allows him / her to use the theory and practice in a meaningful way and to provide full training for students. Together with his teaching work, he defines himself as a specialist fully compliant with the ideas and standards for the academic position of associate professor for which he applies.

This gives me full reason for choosing him as one of the two candidates for the academic position Associate Professor in the professional direction 3.8. Economics (Macroeconomic Analyzes and Policies, International Macroeconomics - in Bulgarian and English). With full conviction and definitely **I express my positive attitude in favor of Chief Assistant Dr. DIMITAR GEORGIEV ZLATINOV.**

11.2 Professional realization and hence the application of Chief Assistant Dr. PAVEL TODOROV STOYNOV does not meet the requirements laid down in the announced competition in the professional direction 3.8. Economics (Macroeconomic Analysis and Policies, International Macroeconomics - in Bulgarian and English), which is confirmed by the documents presented by him and does not give grounds for awarding the academic position of Associate Professor.

17 October 2019
Sofia

Signature:
(Prof. Rossitsa Rangelova, Dr.Ec.Sc.)