

## OPINION

of professor Virginia Ivanova Zhelyazkova, PhD from VUZF University

with regards to the

Competition for the occupation of the academic position "Associate Professor" at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski" in professional field 3.8. Economics (Macroeconomic Analysis and Policies, International Macroeconomics - in Bulgarian and English), which was decided by Pr. 10 / 29.05.2019 of the Academic Council of the Faculty of Economics and Order of the Rector of Sofia University "Kliment Ohridski" № RD 38-460 / 26.07.2019. The competition is announced in State Gazette: issue. 52 / 02.07.2019, based on Art. 7 of the Rules on the Terms and Conditions for Acquisition of Academic Degrees and Occupation of Academic Positions at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski" for the needs of the Economics Department.

### **1. Information about the candidates for the competition**

Two candidates have applied for participation in the announced competition – senior assistant professor Dimitar Georgiev Zlatinov, PhD and senior assistant professor Pavel Todorov Stoynov, PhD.

Senior assistant professor Zlatinov was born in 1987. He holds Bachelor's Degree degrees in Macroeconomics and Business Management from Paisii Hilendarski University in Plovdiv. He then completed two master's programs - Statistics and Financial Econometrics at the Faculty of Economics at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski" and International Economic Relations. International Economics", implemented jointly by the Faculty of Economics of VTU and the Institute of Economics at BAS. In 2015, he defended the PhD in the professional field 3.8. "Economics" at the Faculty of Economics of Sofia University. The topic of his dissertation is: "Interaction between Fiscal and Monetary Policy at Floating Exchange Rate and Currency Board."

Throughout the years, Dr. Zlatinov goes through various specialized trainings in foreign institutions, which contribute to his professional development. Since 2010 he is an assistant professor and since 2016 he is a chief assistant professor in the department of Economics, and since 2018 he is chief assistant professor in the International Economics section at the Institute of Economics at the Bulgarian

Academy of Sciences. In parallel with teaching and scientific work in the period 2008-2016 he worked as an expert at the Bulgarian National Bank. Dr. Zlatinov demonstrates consistency and purpose, as well as a clear orientation of scientific interests in the field of macroeconomic analysis during the years of his career. Dr. Stoynov was born in 1971. He holds Bachelor's Degree and Master's Degree in various majors. He holds two PhDs - in economics at UNWE and in earth sciences at Sofia University. Lack of consistency in his scientific and teaching interests is evident - he has taken classes in both mathematics and economics at the same university, and has declared to have an extremely broad range of his scientific interests, which include tourism, geography, mathematics, operating systems, etc.

## **2. Compliance with the minimum national requirements**

From the reference supplied by Dr. Zlatinov for the fulfillment of the minimum national requirements on his part it is obvious that he has even exceeded them significantly. He has presented habilitation work on the topic of the competition and a sufficient number of scientific publications. The evidence is well arranged and helps to clearly track the applicant's activities.

The same cannot be said for the documents presented by Dr. Stoynov. One of the most important conditions - the applicant's habilitation work - is not existant in this case. This means that he does not meet the national minimum requirements for the academic position he is applying for. Besides all that, there are no documents proving his academic employment as an assistant professor.

## **3. Assessment of applicants' scientific output, academic activities and participation in projects**

Dr. Zlatinov has provided a reference for a total of 43 scientific publications. Of these, 1 monograph of which he is the only author, and 7 co-authored, 9 articles in scientific journals, 12 papers in conference proceedings, 11 publications in scientific series and 2 textbooks / study aids. The nature of his scientific output shows his commitment to the issues he has been exploring and his involvement in various forums. The presence of co-authorship in some of his works is indicative of his ability to work fruitfully with other scholars on various issues. Specifically on the subject of the competition Dr. Zlatinov has presented a report comprising a total of 20 scientific publications, of which 9 are in English and 1 in Russian. These publications are sufficient in number and possess the necessary qualities for the purposes of the competition, fully responding to its announced focus.

Dr. Professor Zlatinov has presented evidence for a significant number of teaching hours done throughout the years. In total they amount to 1842 classroom hours, divided into several subjects: Micro and Macroeconomics first and second part, International Economic Relations, Business Management, Business Policy, Applied Economics, Applied Finance, Applied Macroeconomic Analysis, etc. All the subjects taught fall within the scope of the announced competition. Apart from teaching at Sofia University “St. Kliment Ohridski ”, Dr. Zlatinov has taught at the Paisii Hilendarski University and at the UNWE in similar disciplines in the period 2011-2018. Thus he has gained considerable academic experience, which helps him to grow as a trained and competent lecturer.

Dr. Zlatinov has submitted a report on his participation in a total of five research projects that fall within the scope of the competition. This is another proof of his activity and ability to work in scientific teams.

Dr. Stoynov, as it has already become clear, did not submit information about a published monograph, one of the mandatory requirements under the Law on the Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria (ZRASRB) and the Regulations for its implementation. Information about his other publications has been scattered, making it difficult to be evaluated. The publications presented are from diverse fields of science and are moving away from the focus of the announced competition. Dr. Stoynov, in practice, has not provided reference for his academic employment or for his participation in projects, which makes it impossible to assess his contribution in these fields.

#### **4. Evaluation of the applicants' contributions**

The main contributions of Dr. Zlatinov could be found in his habilitation monograph "Macroeconomic Policy in Bulgaria after the Introduction of the Monetary Board (from theoretical to applied analysis)", published in 2019. This paper is devoted to one of the central and topical issues facing the macroeconomic management of our country - the chosen exchange rate regime and its relevance to Bulgaria. The author argues his position both through detailed qualitative analysis as well as using econometric toolkit. The depth of his reasoning and his rich theoretical background are impressive.

Dr. Zlatinov is also the author of a study aid on International Economics, which was compiled for the purposes of the educational process at Sofia University. This helps to show the candidate's very good preparedness in the subjects he teaches. The toolkit is designed to be easy for students to use. The thought of the author is very clear, the

language is smooth, which is important for such work.

Individual contributions can also be found in the numerous scientific articles and conference reports in which Dr. Zlatinov presents his ideas on various issues in the field of macroeconomic management.

I accept all contributions as described by the applicant. They accurately reflect his scientific output and are presented precisely and clearly.

It is difficult to point out the contributions of the other candidate in the competition – Dr. Stoynov - again due to the lack of completeness in the documentation presented by him. First and foremost, the lack of habilitation work makes it impossible to evaluate his work, and the insufficient number of scientific publications - 15 in total - are on a variety of topics that are not in the focus of the announced competition.

### **5. Critical notes and recommendations**

I have no critical remarks and recommendations to Dr. Zlatinov.

To Dr. Stoynov, I would recommend that in order to be successful in the next competition, he must at least gather all the information about his work and, if he fails to meet the national minimum requirements, endeavor to reach at least the minimum, then arrange his scientific output and present it in a decent way so that it can be evaluated.

### **CONCLUSION**

As a result of the analysis presented, I give my positive opinion on the application of Dr. Dimitar Georgiev Zlatinov. It complies with the national minimum requirements laid down for the academic position of Associate Professor in the ZRASRB and the Adjunct Regulations, and the documents submitted by him for the purposes of this competition clearly show his high level of preparedness on the topic of the competition, his contributions and his academic experience.

Dr. Pavel Todorov Stoynov does not meet the minimum national requirements, the documentation submitted by him are insufficient and unclear and this is the reason why he does not receive a positive evaluation in this competition.

19.10.2019

Signature: .....  
/Prof. Virginia Zhelyazkova, PhD/