

REVIEW

by Totko Neykov Stoyanov, PhD, Professor at the Department of Archaeology of Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski", member of the Scientific Jury, appointed by order of the Rector of SU (No. RD 38-104/ 09.02.2022),

in the competition for the academic position of Associate Professor in the professional field 2.2. History and Archaeology (Archaeology – Architectural Archaeology) published in the State Newspaper 103/ 10.12.2021.

1. In the announced competition, organized at the request of the FS of the Faculty of History (Minutes No. 4/ 26.01.2022) for the needs of the Department of Archaeology, the only candidate is Assoc. Dr. **Daniela Stefanova Stoyanova**. Her documents have been accepted by the Commission appointed by the Order of Mr. Rector No. RD 38-72/ 31.01.2022, and the reason for her participation in the competition procedure is the submitted report that she fulfils the minimum national requirements under Article 2b of the Law on the Development of Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria. D. Stoyanova has graduated Archaeology at the Faculty of History of the Sofia University 1997. In 1998-2001 she was a full-time PhD student at the Department with the topic "*Monumental Architecture in Thrace 5th – 3rd century BC. Construction Materials, Techniques, Structures, Orders*" (2002). Since 2006 he has been a full-time lecturer at the Department of Archaeology.

She participated in the competition with a habilitation thesis published and submitted for evaluation under the title: 'Building Ceramics and Architectural Terracotta from Apollonia Pontica (6th century BC - 3rd century BC)'. Sofia, University Press "St. Kliment Ohridski, 2022. Also contributed 20 publications according to the attached list, all after 2002.

2. Daniela Stoyanova is one of the graduates of the first class of the Program in Archaeology, a prerequisite for a good start in her professional development. The presence of a course in Architectural Archaeology in the program of the specialty and her training in the specialty of Architecture of the Construction Technical School in Varna, provoked Daniela's interest in Classical Monumental Architecture and she, as a student was co-author in a publication on an architectural monument of ancient Odessos (No. 1 on the total list of publications). Today she is a leading researcher in the field of architectural archaeology in Bulgaria. In fact, the inclusion of a core course in this field in the Bachelor's and Master's degree programs of the Archaeology major of Sofia University (usually missing in the programs of other HEIs) is related to the inclusion of Dr. D. Stoyanova as a regular lecturer in the department (holder of the lecture course in "Architectural Archaeology" in the Bachelor's program, with a lecture time of 90 hrs. and 90 hrs. seminars). In this direction, she developed and offered a specialized seminar on "Wall Painting and Architectural Decoration in the Eastern Mediterranean and Thrace" and a lecture course on "Conservation and Restoration of Archaeological Architectural Monuments" in the Master's

program (with a 30 h lectures and 15 h exercises). D. Stoyanova's engagement with these disciplines leads to a teaching load almost double the normative one. Her work with students, both in the lecture and seminar form of training and direct communication with the students, as well as her participation in the summer field practices of archaeology students at the Thracian Urban Center in IAR "Sboryanovo" enable the selection of students who have the qualities to specialize in the field of architectural archaeology. The course projects and diploma theses supervised by her have borne fruit and in recent years there have been graduates of the department who are studying as PhD students with themes in this field or those in which data from architecture also play an important part.

Daniela's knowledge has helped the team studying the Thracian city at IAR Sboryanovo for more than twenty years, of which she has been a member since 1997. Since 2006 she has been Deputy Head and since 2021 Head of the team. Since 2005, at the invitation of colleagues from the Apollonia research team, she has been involved in the processing of the arrays of building ceramics and architectural terracotta from the museum's collections. Daniela Stoyanova was the organizer and actual manager of the scientific research projects to investigate the possible sources of raw materials for the production of building ceramics and architectural terracotta in Apollonia Pontica, realized in the period 2006-2007. Since 2009, following an invitation from the team studying the site of the Temple Complex of the island of St. St. Peter's Church. Cyric and Juliet", she has been working on this extremely important site and contributing to the research of the excavated remains of monumental architecture, architectural decoration, building ceramics and architectural terracotta.

Her authority as an expert was the basis for the invitation to participate in the study and publication of the temple of the Mother of the Gods at Dionysopolis (mod. Balchik), (Appendix 10 A, Monographs No. 6); in the publication of the results of the excavations of the Thracian residence on Mt. Kozi Gramadi; as a consultant to the studies of the sanctuary at Mt. Sekiz harman at the village of Krstević, Hisarya distr. (since 2012); consultant on the monument in the Maltepe mound at the village of Manole (2018-2020), archaeological site at Vasil Levski (since 2020). They are participant and/or leader of a series of projects of the Scientific Research Fund at SU, and many of the texts with which she participates in the competition are the result of the implementation of these projects. She also participated in the organization of the international scientific conferences "Graves, Tombs, Necropolis in their Settlement Environment in the Eastern Mediterranean - Classical to Hellenistic Period", Sofia - Kazanlak - Isperih - Sofia, 09-14.10.2016 and "The Alexandrovo Tomb. 20 years later". 11-12 may 2021, were also carried out within projects in which Daniela Stoyanova has participated.

The qualities of an erudite researcher of ancient monumental architecture in Thrace and the Aegean demonstrated in her appearances at international forums, collective works and other publications led to the invitation to participate as a member of the Getty Connecting Art Histories Seminar "The many lives of ancient monuments 600 BC–AD 600" and "Beyond the Northern Aegean" (2019-2023 r.) and the international team of the ARAH project, in a field

research program in the Xanthi region of Greece, focusing on the territory of ancient Abdera as well.

Daniela Stoyanova has been a member of the Association of Bulgarian Archaeologists since its foundation, and has been a member of the Board since 2015.

3. The monograph with which D. Stoyanova participated in the competition, is dedicated to the building ceramics and architectural terracotta from Apollonia Pontica for the period VI - III century BC, a research directly related to the topic of the competition for associate professor in architectural archaeology. The study has a classical structure of introduction, six chapters, conclusion, bibliography and appendices (tables, list of images, English summary), 192 pages in total.

Chapter 1 is devoted to the aims, objectives, methods and chronological framework of the study. The main objective is defined as the systematization of the information accumulated on this group of artifacts, which are a specific source of civil and public architecture in the territory of an urban center and its people, as well as of their production and/or import. Highlights are the synthesis of data from the site of the Temple Complex and Sanctuary on St. St. Cyric and Juliet, and the data on building ceramics and architectural terracotta from Apollonia Pontica, which are relevant to the material studied from the Temenos of St. Helena Island. Sts. Cyric and Juliet to arrive at a generalized picture of monumental temple and public architecture in Apollonia Pontica.

The tasks involved in achieving the stated objective are to substantially finalize the processing of the vast database of Stoic pottery and architectural terracotta accumulated over 100 years of excavations (and chance finds) from the island of St. St. Cyric and Juliet, from the city and its necropolises and various structures on the territory of the polis, combining data from the author's personal work on the processing of materials of different origins, begun since 2005, as well as newly acquired ones. Some of these efforts have already found expression in the author's publications out of print (cf. Appendix 10A nos. 19-21, 24, 33, 45, 47) or in print.

Informally, the author has introduced the reader to the usual but also specific methods of researching archaeological material. The chronological framework of the study is also justified - c. mid-6th to late 3rd/early 2nd century BC - on the basis of the artefacts known to date.

In Chapter 2. Research History and Historiography, information is succinctly presented on the chronology of research in Sozopol and the region, publications related to it, information on research and publication of materials, of the type studied in the monograph, from the Western and Northern Black Sea coasts, and important general research on architectural terracotta and building ceramics.

Chapters 3, 4, 5, and 6 are devoted respectively to Late Classical and Hellenistic building ceramics, Temple architecture and architectural decoration, Archaic building ceramics Architectural terracotta. The apparent chronological and thematic dissonance in the titles of the

four chapters is the result of making sense of the internal logic in the presentation of the available data base in order to achieve the emphasis in the research objectives stated above.

The building pottery of the Late Classic and Early Hellenistic periods, for which the most voluminous empirical material has been accumulated, is presented first (ch. 3). The main characteristics of flat and roof tiles, of gable tiles and antefixes, and of a new element, floor slabs, the production of which has been documented, so far, only in Apollonia Pontica, are highlighted. Their characteristics are illustrated with photographic and graphic images made by the author. Arguments are made for the local production of these elements of building ceramics. On the one hand is the stamping (with catalogue data in Tables 1-4, appended at the end of the work), especially of the flat Corinthian tiles, such specimens having been documented mainly in Apollonia and its hinterland, and on the other hand the limited data on the import of tiles from Sinope and Heraclea Pontica during this period. These data are supported by the results of the archaeometric analysis of samples from the claybeds in the Apollonia area and comparisons with samples of stamped roof tiles showing similarities with the claystone samples (cf. Appendix 10A no. 24). This compendium of building pottery, mainly produced in Apollonia, during the period in question is a good starting point for the publication of empirical material from various sites in the city, its necropolises and the hora.

The logic, in the next chapter (4), to consider the data on the development and characteristics of the *Temple architecture and architectural decoration* of Apollonia Pontica, acquired in the early investigations of the island of St. Peter. Cyric and especially in the renewed studies of the Temenos of Apollo Ietros (2009).) and in various parts of the peninsula of Scamnum in the late twentieth and twenty-first centuries, is based on the discovery of hundreds of fragments of Late Archaic and Late Classic and Early Hellenistic flat and roof tiles and a limited number, but of exceptional importance, of fragments of architectural terracotta from the Late Archaic/Early Classic and Late Classic and Hellenistic periods. Knowledge of their characteristics and dating features are an important research "tool" despite the minimal remains of the architectural monuments, allows the clarification of their planning and construction features, phases and chronology.

The presented comprehensive picture of temple and cult monumental architecture (temples altars and other buildings) from the Temenos and the survey of monuments of the same character from the peninsula (known mainly from preliminary publications), with the substantiated proposals for interpretation and periodization, has a distinctly contributory character. In my opinion, the content of this chapter predetermines the presence of monumental temple and cult architecture in the title of the monograph as well.

After the previous chapter, the presentation of the synthesized information on the securely identified types of flat, roof and gable tiles and antefixes without decoration, of the Archaic period, used in Apollonia Pontica in Chapter 5, seems logical. Where possible, finds of Archaic building ceramics have been associated with specific buildings and information has been presented from which a chronology has been derived.

The last chapter, devoted to the analysis of the architectural terracotta from Apollonia from the middle of the 6th century BC to about the middle - end of the 3rd century BC, has a representative share in the monograph. The study is based on published artifacts available to the author. The following groups of architectural terracotta are examined:

- Archaic antefixes without decoration, Palmette antefixes of the Archaic and Late Classical/Hellenistic periods, Archaic antefixes with Gorgon and braid;
- Archaic gable tiles with watercourse, Archaic gable tiles with braid, Archaic gable tiles with painted decoration, Late Classic/Hellenistic gable tiles with relief meander and gable tiles with Ionic cymation;
- Archaic tiles with Ionic cymation and astragalus; Late Archaic tiles with warriors;
- Late Classical/Hellenistic simians with relief decoration of lion heads, with alternating heads of satyrs and half palmettes/palmettes, with alternating heads of nymphs (plant goddesses) and half palmettes/palmettes, and alternating heads of satyr and nymph.

In presenting this highly fragmented material, Daniela Stoyanova has chosen a complex and difficult model to implement - the compilation of a catalogue description accompanied by photographic and graphic images and reconstructions to illustrate the proposed volumetric and functional reconstruction. This data is set in the context of information on the origin/context of the fragment(s) and commentary and interpretation on parallels from the Black Sea and Achaean ranges, available interpellations of the parallels as function, school/studio data and dating. Her ability to analyse and present pictorially even the most insignificant fragment and to place it in the context of possible information in the specialist literature on clay and stone architectural decoration and sculpture is on full display here.

The systematized information has allowed the author a more comprehensive reconstruction of three types of roofs from the Late Archaic and Early Classic periods in Apollonia Pontica. All three reconstructions include different types of Corinthian flat and Laconian roof tiles and associated gable tiles and antefixes. Most striking among these is the roof of the Archaic temple, with frontal tiles with a braid and Gorgon antepices indicating a direct connection to the metropolis of Miletus.

The data for roofs of the Late Classical/Hellenistic period also show the use of different types. The main roof type consists of flat and overlapping Corinthian-type tiles combined with gable tiles and antefixes without decoration. Probably mostly in public buildings, roofs with gable tiles and antefixes with different relief decoration were also used. Of interest are the lion-headed lateral sims which replace the gable tiles in the roof, and the palmette antefixes with lacquer roof tiles (Type 5) and gable tiles with meander (Type 1), which indicate the use of a mixed roof type of Corinthian flat and lacquer roof tiles.

Although few, the evidence for the use of architectural terracotta in the Late Classic/Hellenistic periods from Apollonia Pontica highlights, on the one hand, its contacts with the leading centre of production in this period, Messambria, and, on the other, suggests possibilities for identifying Apollonian production of architectural terracotta (simian with relief lion heads, simian with alternating satyr heads and half palmettes/palmettes).

The main results of the analysis and interpretation of the archaeological materials used are systematized in the conclusion. The author rightly expects them to serve for the publication of the data from many excavated complexes in the territory of the ancient city and in its hinterland.

The peer-reviewed monograph is a thorough scientific work exploring and interpreting a complex issue in the field of ancient monumental architecture based on the rich archaeological data from the investigations of ancient Apollonia Pantica and its hora and represents a good basis for a full-fledged publication of artifacts from different complexes.

4. Daniela Stoyanova also participated in the competition with 20 of her scientific publications: studies and articles, all published after 2002. This is impressive, but for colleagues who know her well, it is a logical consequence of her work on various scientific problems and projects with a willingness to share information and specific knowledge (for which she is often sought in such endeavors) and her personal understanding that the modern research process is in many cases inevitably a collective intellectual effort.

All of the publications on this list bear the hallmarks of in-depth research with undoubted contributions. Among them, I would single out a few. First and foremost, the study of tomb architecture in Classical and Hellenistic Thrace (app. 21) in the prestigious American publisher Wiley Blackwell's *A Companion to Ancient Thrace* (2015) stands out. The very fact that Daniela Stoyanova was invited by the publishers and compilers to author a text on this representative topic is an indication of her appreciation as a specialist in this subject. Within a predetermined small text volume, the characteristics of the more than 200 tombs known at the time of publication are presented in a balanced way, such as spatial position, construction materials and techniques, structural and compositional solutions (with basic variants), elements of the interior and decoration, with an emphasis on the layout and features of the Ionic and Doric order within the entrance openings, important for defining architectural concepts and connections with the main trends in Hellenistic monumental architecture.

The study of the import of tiles from Sinope and Herakleia Pontica in the Western Black Sea region, reported at a prestigious international forum in Sinope (Turkey, Ant. Sinope) in 2009 (Appendix 13), is a manifestation of the personal experience gained in the processing of the research material, erudition and professional self-confidence in the problems of the submitted habilitation thesis. The synthesis and interpretation of information presented, in fact from a more comprehensive region because, in addition to the West Pontic *apoikies*, data from Panskoe in Northwestern Crimea and Olbia are also included, is the first of its comprehensive nature. The conclusion that imports from these leading production centers into the surveyed settlement

centers were not particularly intensive because of the highly developed local production of tiles and architectural terracotta was welcomed and the report was highly appreciated by the authoritative specialists in the field of architectural terracotta and building ceramics present.

The complete publication of the results of the study of a monumental building of a fortified residence of the peak Kozi Gramadi, in collaboration with the researcher (appendix 16), is an example of an invitation to Daniela Stoyanova for professional help in the research and interpretation of a specific, practically unique for Thrace, object of monumental architecture. On the basis of the rich, qualitatively executed photographic and graphic documentation and the discovered artefacts, following a precise architectural analysis, the plan, building materials and construction technique, the architectural decoration have been defined and a narrow chronology of the building with a probable public function has been proposed. Its place in the context of the development of monumental architecture in the region of the western half of the Upper Thracian Lowlands and the Sashtinska Sredna Gora, as well as in the Aegean area during the Classical Period, is defined.

The study, in which a comprehensive publication of the results of the rescue research of a unique monumental tomb at village of Gagovo, Popovo municipality, together with the head of the excavations (app. 17) is an example of scrupulous, professional fieldwork, with the preparation of quality documentation and presentation and interpretation of both the architectural monument and all the artefacts, to arrive at a reconstruction and interpretation of a highly ruined construction of a monumental tomb with two parallel domed burial chambers, with a common ante-burial chamber, additional rooms and at least two phases in the solution of the pre-facade space - an architectural project without analogue, both in Thrace and neighbouring lands, executed at a high level. This discovery provoked field research and the identification in the immediate vicinity of an unknown residential center in the Getae lands of the Classical and Early Hellenistic periods.

In the attached general list of works, the topic of architectural archaeology is also defining for the scientific interests of D. Stoyanova. The list is impressive for the number of publications, publications and scientific formats in which D. Stoyanova is a co-author in collective monographs (5), studies and articles (49), scientific communications (24), texts in exhibition catalogues, among which the one of the Thracian exhibition at the Louvre Museum stands out (11), scientific reviews (2), compilation and scientific editing of collections (4). Probably to be singled out is the range of publications related to research on the Thracian city at Sboryanovo, in the archaeological team of which she has been involved since the beginning of her professional career and to which she will devote much more as director.

Daniela Stoyanova's publications are distinguished by exceptional thoroughness, clear, strictly professional expression and style. A sign of the scientific contributions in her publications in prestigious journals are the numerous citations in the scientific literature, attached in the documentation, as reflected in world databases (Scopus, Web of science).

Knowing closely her manner of work and her publications, rather protocol, I would add that her texts are distinguished by correctness and there are no elements of plagiarism.

In conclusion, and as a consequence of the above, confirming the above mentioned qualities of Daniela Stoyanova as a formed thorough researcher in the field of architectural archaeology, but also in other important areas of ancient archaeology, precise field archaeologist, skilled teacher and educator, loyal colleague and friend, I declare my confidence to vote positively for the award of the title of the head of the as. Dr. Daniela Stefanova Stoyanova to the academic position of Associate Professor.

April 9th , 2022

Totko Stoyanov

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Totko Stoyanov".