

## POSITION

by Prof. Dr. Lyudmil Lyubomirov Georgiev, Honorary Professor of the NBU and a member of his Board of Trustees, last habilitation in Ph.D. 3.7. Administration and management appointed as a member of the Scientific Jury with Order RD-38-697 / 09.12.2019 of the Rector of Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski ", for conducting a competition for occupying an academic position " Associate Professor ", in the professional field 3.3 Political Science (Regional Management and Policy), announced in SG, issue no. 93 of 26.11.2019 of the applicant - Chap. Assistant Professor Elena Angelova Kalfova-Voynova.

The idea of the volume boundaries of the submitted works is in accordance with the requirements of the Academic Staff Development Act. In this sense, I consider as a monographic work anyone with a volume of more than 100 pages and meeting the other conditions for this type of scientific work, and for studios - a text with a volume between 20 and 99 pages, meeting the other requirements for this type of academic text. Article Respective - Volume up to 19 pages plus all other requirements for this type of work.

- I. Degree of implementation of the minimum national requirements under Art. 3.3 Political Science (Regional Governance and Policy) from chap. Assistant Professor Elena Angelova Kalfova-Voynova

The competition for associate professor in the professional field 3.3. Political Science (Regional Governance and Policy) was announced in accordance with the established legal order for the needs of the Department of Public Administration at Sofia University.

The only candidate for the competition is Ch. Assistant Professor Elena Angelova Kalfova-Voynov. The submitted documentation for the competition meets the requirements of the Law for the development of the academic staff in the Republic of Bulgaria and the Rules for the implementation of the Law for the development of the academic staff in the Republic of Bulgaria.

- II. Research and results.

For the needs of the competition, Dr. Kalfova presented:

<b>Monographs</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Studios</b>	<b>7 (incl.2 in English)</b>
<b>Articles</b>	<b>5 (1 in English)</b>
<b>Scientific reports</b>	<b>2 in English</b>
<b>Participation in projects</b>	<b>No information</b>
<b>ALL</b>	<b>15</b>

## **I. Evaluation of the candidate's results and contributions.**

### **Evaluation of contributions to monograph work:**

The evaluation of the proposed monographic project leads to the following contributions:

1. The dynamics of public governance at territorial level, the transfer of powers from national to supranational and sub-national levels, and the effect of this activity with its advantages and disadvantages have been investigated.
2. Significant theoretical and practical conclusions regarding specific policies depending on the market, the state and civil society have been analyzed and provided.
3. An approach combining institutionalism and neo-institutionalism with public policy formulation and implementation has been implemented.
4. The different types of regional institutions and their place in the governmental system of the state are defined and analyzed. The factors for its development and the relationship between the main factors - the type of existing regional institutions - are analyzed.
5. A specific triad of criteria - effectiveness, efficiency and fairness - for identifying regional development problems and theoretical concepts explaining the specifics of this process is derived.
6. The stages of the development of EU regional policy in the context of the change of objectives, approaches, instruments, monitoring and evaluation system and the main prerequisites for this are analyzed.
7. The potential of the introduced regional associations of the municipalities and their ability to significantly influence the management system and the ability to use them as a model for organizing the management in different public spheres were evaluated.
8. Suggestions have been made for possible future reforms of regional governance - both its institutional organization and its functional characteristics.
9. Using the comparative method applied and the multiple linear regression method, the overall effect of the effect of the selected multiple factors (independent variables) on the dependent variable (policy outcome indicator) is shown.
10. Defining on page 32 five types of regionalization and commenting on them is a significant part of the monograph with great potential for further reflection.
11. I particularly emphasize the contribution of the author in developing the topic of decentralization of territorial governance in Chapter One, with the proviso that the work would gain even more if the former counties were exploited for what the areas were created for, for political purposes. reasons why this did not happen, and was associated with huge waste of time and money.
12. As a significant contribution, I define the multiple linear regression analysis of the factors for regional development for Bulgaria at three levels - national, regional and Sofia district.

### **Remarks and suggestions for improvement:**

1. The issue of establishing a regional-level governance structure is closely linked to the

issue of significantly reducing the number of municipalities that has been neglected to be analyzed.

2. The same applies to the lack of text concerning the process of globalization, as it is developing rapidly and in line with the process of globalization as creating a completely new form of territorial cooperation, and new conditions for democratization and economic prosperity.

Evaluation of contributions in other attached publications.

Non-monographic publications (7 studies, 5 papers and 2 scientific papers) presented at international conferences express Dr. Kalfova's attention span over a long period of time on a particular subject and subject of research, which shows research persistence, consistency and thoroughness. According to their contributions, they can be grouped as follows:

1. (Publications Nos. 1, 5, 6, 11)<sup>1</sup> The thesis is that the change in the management system leads to a change in the specific content of regional policy and vice versa - a change in the goals and instruments of regional policy can lead to a change in the institutional system. The need for regional governance and regional policy to be considered as a single subject of study is justified and protected precisely because of their inextricable conditionality.
2. (Publications Nos. 1, 11, 151) The relationship between the development and change of regional policy and regional governance is assessed - part of the overall tendency to change the role and functions of the state and the way of exercising public power.
3. (Publications 1,2,5,6,9,10,11,15) The dependencies in the triad of regional policy - regional governance and institutional reforms are theoretically and practically protected.
4. (Publications 1,13) Theoretical and practical impact assessment.
5. (Publications 1,2,9,10,13) Develop and approve a methodology for assessing regional policy.
6. (Publications Nos. 1, 6, 10, 11) The thesis is that the specific content of regional policy is the result of the interaction between economic and social processes that determine the specifics of the institutional system.
7. (Publications № 1, 2, 3, 4, 6, 8) The main features of the applied regional policy in Bulgaria are outlined. The development of all its elements - goals, tools, approaches, management system - is analyzed. Regulatory analysis is combined with empirical research to evaluate the extent to which policy objectives are achieved. —
8. (Publications No. 1, 2, 4, 8) Particularly valuable evidence is that the results achieved do not reach the defined goals.
9. (Publications Nos. 1, 3, 6, 10) The importance of the quality of governance as a major factor, equal to the economic factors for achieving the goals of the regional policy in Bulgaria, has been proved.
10. (Publications Nos. 1, 9, 11, 13) As a result of the theories developed in advance (a framework

---

<sup>1</sup> According to the numbering in the list of publications provided by the candidate.

has made a comparative analysis of the main types of assessment instruments, determining their applicability to regional policy, outlining their main advantages and limitations.

11. (Publications Nos 1, 5, 7, 14) The EU regional policy is analyzed over a period of time, determining the degree of influence of each of its elements on the policies, governance practices and institutional systems of the EU Member States.

12. (Publications Nos. 1, 4, 6, 8, 11) The thesis is that the quality of regional policy evaluation does not depend on the choice of a particular method but on the usefulness of the information provided to improve the quality of the policy pursued.

13. (Publications Nos. 1, 15) The main characteristics of the different types of regional institutions are analyzed.

14. (Publications Nos. 1, 15) It has been proved by the author that the development of regional institutions depends not so much on their form but on the change in their functions.

15. (Publications Nos. 1, 5, 7) By applying the benchmarking method, the degree of influence of the Europeanization process and the transfer of management practices on the adopted models of regional governance and the specific content of regional policies in the countries of Central and Eastern Europe are determined .

16. (Publications № 1, 2, 3, 7, 8, 12, 14) The results of the conducted institutional reforms in Bulgaria and the potential for development of the different types of regional institutions were evaluated. Measures are proposed to optimize the functioning of existing regional institutions.

17. (Publications № 1, 2, 14) The stages in the development of the regional governments in Bulgaria and the reasons for the limited institutional reform at the regional level in Bulgaria are analyzed.

### **III. Quotations.**

There is no requirement in Bulgaria when someone quotes you to inform you about this, informing you exactly where and how many times. This is a serious and so far insurmountable drawback of our native academic system, which makes inaccurate any assessment of the citations made to scientific publications.

For the needs of the competition, the applicant has provided a reference to the citations of 27 of her works, of which 3 are citations by foreign authors. 13 of the citations are in monographs and collective volumes with scientific peer review. 11 references to the author were made in non-refereed scientific peer-reviewed journals. Three citations have been noted in scientific publications, referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases.

Dr. Kalfova's 24 citations were made in peer-reviewed publications, which defined them as authoritative.

Considering the level of publications in which the works of the applicant were cited and the content cited, I consider them completely sufficient for the needs of the competition.

### **IV. The report on the implementation of the minimum national requirements under Art. 26 of the ZRASRB for the scientific field 3. The social, economic and legal sciences show:**

Indicator # 1 Dissertation work for the award of educational and scientific degree "Doctor" - compliance with national requirements

Indicator # 2 Habilitation work - monograph - compliance with national requirements

### **V. Evaluation of the results of participation in research and creative projects, and application of the results obtained in practice.**

Dr. Kalfova has participated in 33 research projects with 29 of them being scientifically applied.

She has managed 4 projects; was a key expert and expert at 25; member of an interagency expert group in 1 project; teacher and coordinator in 1 project; expert and coordinator in 1 project. Five of the projects are directly related to the topic of the competition and 11 are related to important aspects of the theme.

The review of the applicant's project activity shows that Dr. Kalfova has a very active project activity and was awarded in 2009 by the management of SU "Kliment Ohridski".

A very good certificate for the candidate is her membership in three reputable professional organizations

#### **VI. Teaching and teaching activities.**

The accompanying official report on Dr. Kalfova's teaching and teaching activity shows that during the last four academic years she has had considerable overload.

There is no reference to student surveys or other forms of assessment of the quality of its teaching.

#### **VII. Personal impressions of the applicant.**

I know the applicant from 2009 as a partner of Sofia University "St. Kl.Ohridski "in the joint consortium for training of public administration employees.

On a personal level, I define her as an extremely responsive colleague, a diligent and accurate person, with modern views and up-to-date awareness, with her own opinion, which she expresses unreservedly.

I declare that I have no joint scientific papers and publications with the candidate.

#### **VIII. Opinions, recommendations and notes on the applicant's activities and achievements.**

In her publications, Dr. Kalfova has raised many important questions about the theory and practice of the scientific field in which she works. At the same time, it is precisely because of their high number that they have underestimated the final validity of even a small part of them.

This gives me reason to make the following remarks and recommendations:

It is not very clear which of the definitions for the region uses the author - geographical, economic or otherwise?

It should be emphasized that the EU definition of a region is in line with community processes and does not cover the scientific definition of a region as an independent territorial unit in the taxonomic division of the country.

One of the key questions that could be addressed by the applicant is "Why Europe of the Regions?" This is a key question to which the whole system of regional governance in the EU depends, as the objectives of the Union are clear and implicit and their assumption and justification, as well as the identification of political and economic factors, would be a necessary and interesting aspect of such research.

The crucial definition of Europeanization of Radaelli, CM on page 203, key to point 4, allows Dr. Kalfova to supplement it substantially by adding "European values and attitudes", but the possibility is unfortunately missed ... The very term "Europeanization" "Is very debatable in its application to European countries and it is also an opportunity for the author to propose a suitable alternative term with a meaning identical to the used.

#### **CONCLUSION**

As a result of the critical analysis of the submitted works on the competition, I define the whole set of scientific and applied scientific contributions as: Upgrading and developing existing knowledge on the stated topic.

This conclusion, together with the qualitative and responsible teaching, expert and administrative activity of the candidate, give me a definite reason to suggest that the honorable members of the scientific jury be awarded to Ch. Assistant Professor Elena Kalfova Academic Position "Assistant Professor".

Sofia, 21/03/2020 r.

Member of the Scientific Jury  
(Prof. Dr. Ludmil Georgiev)